



Strengthening Quality Management, Capabilities and Infrastructure in Lebanon

EuropeAid/117725/D/SV/LB

Final Report

October 2004 – August 2008

This text has been drafted in the framework of an EU-funded project. The views expressed herein are those of beneficiary only and therefore in no way reflect the official opinion of the European Commission

Project Title	Strengthening Quality Management, Capabilities and Infrastructure in Lebanon		
Project Number	EuropeAid/117725/D/SV/LB		
Country	Lebanon		
Name	Local Operator Ministry of Economy & Trade		
Address	Azarieh Building – Block 01 – 8 th floor Martyr Square – Beirut Central District Beirut - Lebanon		
Tel Number	+ 961 1 982 357		
Fax Number	+ 961 1 982 229		
Telex/e mail	aberro@economy.gov.lb		
Contact Person	Ali Berro		
Signatures			
Date of report	February 2009		
Reporting period	10/2004 – 08/2008		
Author of report	Ali Berro	Director of the Programme	
EC M & E team	_____	signature	_____
			Date
EC Delegation (Task Manager)	_____	signature	_____
			Date

Table of Contents

1	Project Synopsis	4
2	Executive Summary	5
3	Review on Progress and Performance.....	8
	3.1 Policy and Programme Context	8
	3.2 Objectives achieved.....	12
	3.3 Activities Undertaken.....	17
	3.4 Assumptions and Risks Status/Update	70
	3.5 Management and Coordination	74
	3.6 Resources and budget used.....	76
	3.7 Key Quality/Sustainability issues.....	77
4	Lesson learned.....	82

1 Project Synopsis

Project Title	Strengthening Quality Management, Capabilities and Infrastructure in Lebanon - Technical Assistance Contract to the Quality Programme
Project Nr	EuropeAid/117725/D/SV/LB
Country	Lebanon
Project objectives	The overall objective of the Quality Programme is to help, improve and develop the major functions of the conformity assessment chain, while reinforcing awareness and co-ordination across private and public sector organisations. All the objectives are within the task of protecting the health & safety of Consumers and increasing Lebanese exports to EC Countries
Planned Outputs	<p>Policy Component</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a national Quality Policy and support to its implementation • Capacity Building for MoET and other related Ministries • Review of legal framework • Enhancement of Market Surveillance <p>Institutional Component</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Well functioning Quality Infrastructure • Support to leading testing laboratories • Creation of a national accreditation system • Creation of an operational metrology network • Support to LIBNOR in improving its operational capacity <p>Enterprise Component</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To assist industries and exporters in identifying the means for resolving international trade issues • To assist companies with the implementation of quality management systems, eventually leading to certification • To improve awareness of the private sector, towards quality and consumer protection issues • Establish information services and links to meet the needs of companies and the supply of relevant technological expertise • Establishment of a "Lebanese National Quality Centre"
Project activities	<p>Technical assistance to organise the conformity assessment structure in Lebanon</p> <p>Advice on European technical legislation</p> <p>Training and up-grading skills for a qualified group of civil servants</p> <p>Technical assistance to CAB's and training of staff, including introduction of quality management systems and preparation for accreditation</p> <p>Assessment of technical needs for testing and calibration laboratories and procurement of equipment</p> <p>Technical assistance in establishing a national accreditation scheme and a national metrology network</p> <p>Technical assistance to LIBNOR, including a National Enquiry Point</p> <p>Awareness campaigns</p> <p>Promotion of quality management in the public and private sector</p>
Project starting date and status	24 October 2004 Finished
Project duration	38 months
Contractor	Tecnitas

2 Executive Summary

This is a special report prepared by Quality Unit at the request of the ECD. The report gives an account of the achievements in the project 'Strengthening Quality Management, Capabilities and Infrastructure in Lebanon - Technical Assistance Contract to the Quality Programme' (Quality Programme), as well as the aspects of sustainability and lessons learned.

The Quality Programme was implemented between October 2004 and December 2007, while for a number of activities the period of implementation was extended to August 2008.

The period of implementation coincided with a period of heightened political conflict and tension in Lebanon. A number of prominent political, intellectual and military leaders were assassinated, and a string of bomb attacks and other forms of violent civil unrest took place. Also the political situation, centring on the resignation of a number of ministers and non-convening of the Parliament, became deadlocked. That led ultimately to a short period of violence in May 2008, which led in turn to the internationally brokered Doha Agreement and consequently to the election of a new President for the Republic and the formation of a unity government were as partial solutions to some of the political differences.

On top of the internal political unrest and violence, the programme witnessed the war in the summer of 2006, when Israel attacked Lebanon. That had serious consequences for the country in terms of death and destruction, but also for the programme in terms of some significant delays in implementation.

Notwithstanding, this uneasy political and security situation, the Quality Programme managed to keep functioning and to produce notable results through the unremitting participation and dedication of its stakeholders.

As conclusion, it can be stated that, with regard to the specific objectives, definitively progress has been made. Although the progress has not been even in all fields, a distinctive momentum has been created among the business community, in the quality infrastructure institutions.

The major results of the Quality Programme are summarised hereunder in relation to its three components:

Policy Component

- National Quality Policy prepared;
- Database on national technical regulations and involvement of different ministries in conformity assessment;
- Library at MoET with books, journals and standards on quality related topics;
- Certified quality management system in the Quality Unit of MoET, as first public sector institution in Lebanon;
- Staff of the Quality Unit educated and trained in most aspects of quality infrastructure and quality management issues;
- Completed review of legal framework for technical regulations and conformity assessment and drafting of eight new and amended laws;
- Feasibility study on export certification;

- Training of about 100 inspectors from different ministries in basic food hygiene and practical inspection skills in the framework of support to market surveillance.

Institutional Component

- Completed analysis of existing structure and technical capabilities of the Lebanese testing laboratory sector and metrology network;
- Regulations for metrology drafted and plan for the national metrology function;
- Selection of calibration and testing laboratories for technical support;
- Extensive sets of technical specifications prepared for the purchase of laboratory equipment and for technical assistance through training and consultancy for quality infrastructure organisations;
- Successful tendering of equipment and training, including contracts with participating laboratories and assistance to site preparation and commissioning of equipment;
- Intensive training of laboratory management and staff for 16 laboratories through 23 training courses on ISO 17025, 7 meetings of experience exchange groups, and in-house technical training on specific methods;
- Extensive consultancy activities performed to laboratories for preparation to accreditation;
- Two supported laboratories have achieved accreditation and six other supported laboratories have applied for accreditation and are at different stages of the accreditation assessment process;
- Organisational setup of national accreditation body prepared and set of internal procedures prepared;
- Thirty persons trained as technical assessors for the different fields of accreditation and in addition 11 persons trained as lead assessors;
- Three specific database applications for the national standards organisation developed and implemented;
- LIBNOR has become full member of ISO and partner member of CEN;
- Major reorganisation of working methods and procedures implemented at LIBNOR, new structure for Technical Committees implemented and LIBNOR applies the Code of Good Practice for Standardisation from the WTO/TBT Agreement;

Enterprise Component

- Analysis of economic sectors completed and six sectors selected for special attention;
- Nine Quality Info Newsletters edited, printed and distributed
- Nine ABC Guides prepared, edited, printed and distributed
- Reasonable level of media coverage, contributing to the visibility of the programme;
- Series of seminars and conferences held, informing a wide audience about the importance of quality and quality infrastructure, including promotional campaigns on quality at universities, vocational institutions and secondary schools.
- Strong brand identity of the Quality Programme created, among others with the help of an attractive logo;
- QUALEB website;
- Fruitful cooperation with NGO's and other donor organisations and projects, resulting in a series of joint activities;

- Intensive training to 50 selected companies on different aspects of the implementation of quality management systems through 34 training courses on ISO 9001 related subjects and 23 training courses on ISO 22000 related subjects;
- Intensive consultancy efforts to 50 selected organisation concerning the practical implementation of quality management systems;
- 38 organisation have achieved a certified quality management system (19 for ISO 9001 and 19 for ISO 22000).

Building up a complete quality infrastructure for a country and introducing quality management systems as new business models in the private and public sectors is a long-term endeavour. It is a form of change management on a national scale. For Lebanon it implies a total change from one system of conformity assessment to another, as well as changing the mind sets of managers. Making the change from one system to the other takes time; actually it takes years. It is not just a matter of changing the rule books and the organisational setups. It is foremost, a matter of training people and changing their behaviour, so that they will be able and convinced to apply new ways of working.

Therefore, the sustainability of the achievements of the Quality Programme lays in long term continuation of the work. It requires building up a sufficient level of confidence and competence in the different organisations, so that they will become self-sustaining in their activities.

A number of the activities that were started in the Quality Programme are not finished at the end of the project. Fortunately, many of them can be continued on a longer term. Partly through the start of a new project, 'Sustaining Quality', some aspects of the quality infrastructure can be tackled that the Quality Programme did not deal with, such as inspection and certification, proficiency testing and the control over the safety of food. Finally, the ECD has indicated that it has the intention to continue with support to the quality infrastructure in Lebanon also in the period of 2009-2012. Therefore, sustainability of the many activities with the long term development process is guaranteed.

3 Review on Progress and Performance

3.1 Policy and Programme Context

Introduction

This is the Final Report on the first phase of the project 'Strengthening Quality Management, Capabilities and Infrastructure in Lebanon' (also known as the 'Quality Programme'). It covers the period from October 2004 to August 2008. The Quality Programme was a wide ranging project, in which different activities relating to different budget lines were executed by different contractors (See table).

No.	Budget item	Budget	Activities
1.0	Main technical assistance	€ 4.7 (incl. contribution beneficiary)	Tecnitas contract for project management and technical assistance in all aspects of building a quality infrastructure (legislation, accreditation, standardisation, metrology, conformity assessment, market surveillance, awareness)
2.0	Contracts with specialised Member State institutions	€ 3.0	Gruppo Soges contract, mainly for training and consultancy to laboratories and companies on implementation of quality management systems
3.0	Supply contracts (equipment)	€ 6.0	22 contracts for the supply of laboratory testing equipment, printing and visibility items
4.0	Other service contracts	€ 0.6	96 contracts for among others printing, web design, communications strategy, graphic design, missions abroad, etc.
5.0	Audits / evaluation	€ 0.4	
6.0	Contingencies	€ 0.7	2 contracts
		€ 15.4 Million	

This report is written under the sole responsibility of the Quality Unit at the Ministry of Economy and Trade (MoET) in Lebanon. The simple reason is that MoET, through its roles as contracting Authority and Beneficiary, was the only institution responsible for the programme in total.

In the initial setup, the Quality Programme was supposed to end in December 2007. However, due to external factors during the implementation period, the Financing Agreement was extended to August 2008, but not for all budget lines, in particular, budget line 1.0, which related to the contract for technical assistance to the Quality Programme. Nevertheless, the contractor, Tecnitas, produced a 'Final Contractor Report' at the request of the ECD. This report covers the period to December 2008. The contractor for the training and consultancy activities, Gruppo Soges, produced a final report in November 2008, covering its activities in the period from November 2006 to August 2008.

This Final Report is an adaption of the Tecnitas Final Contractor report, combining it with the Gruppo Soges Report and extending it to August 2008. At the request of the ECD special attention will be paid to the sustainability of activities and results.

Related Projects

The Quality Programme operated within the framework of a substantial package of technical support from the EU to Lebanon, following the signing of the Association Agreement in 2002. The project had relationships with a number of other EU funded projects that addressed, to a certain extent the same target group, in particular the small and medium sized enterprises in Lebanon in the industrial and agro-food sectors:

- Lebanon Integrated SME Support Programme (EuropeAid/120155/D/SER/LB)
- Support to the Euro-Lebanese Centre for Industrial Modernisation (ELCIM: EuropeAid/120265/D/SER/LB)
- Technical Assistance to the Agricultural Development Project (ADP: EuropeAid/119802/D/SER/LB)
- Institutional Strengthening of the Consumer Protection Directorate (Twinning Grant Agreement LB04/AA/HE/02)

The five projects, which were running in parallel, had all approximately the same start and end dates. The team of the Quality Programme kept in contact with each of these projects on a more or less regular basis for the exchange of information and coordination of activities. A good level of cooperation was achieved with the ADP project, by means of joint training activities. With ELCIM an informal agreement was reached for companies, interested in quality management, not to participate in both projects. The twinning project deals with improving consumer protection and market surveillance in the Ministry of Economy and Trade which was also one of the subjects of the Quality Programme. As both projects were located in the same ministry, exchanging information was easy and frequent. However, after the replacement of the Resident Technical Adviser, this exchange reversed into a rather formalistic way, solely via the Director of the Quality Programme, as the responsible person in MoET for this project. Also in the field of market surveillance was the project 'Capacity Building of Municipalities in performing Consumer Protection and Market Surveillance' that included training and procurement of equipment for the market surveillance in municipalities. This project ended in September 2006.

The contract for the technical assistance to the Quality Programme was partially replaced by a new project, 'Sustaining Quality', with the same contractor and the same team of advisers. This contract will run to July 2009, to be superseded by a planned new phase of the Quality Programme. The Sustaining Quality project is partly a prolongation of activities started during the Quality Programme and partly dealing with new aspects, such as inspection and certification, proficiency testing, food safety, and a national quality award. The 'Sustaining Quality' project ran in parallel with the extension of the Quality Programme from January to August 2008.

Newer projects that are related the Quality Programme (and Sustaining Quality) are in the first place the MACLE project ('Market Access and Compliance for Lebanese Exports'), funded by EFTA and implemented through UNIDO. This three year programme with a budget of \$ 2.2 million was developed in cooperation between UNIDO, Association of Lebanese Industrialists (ALI), and the Quality Programme in order to avoid overlaps. The MACLE project concentrates on packaging, few agro-food sectors, market surveillance and voluntary marking of products. The project started in April 2007 and the Director of the Quality Programme represents the MoET in the project steering committee.

There is another new international project with close links to the some of the subjects of the Quality Programme and more in particular the Sustaining Quality Project. It is a project funded by the Italian government and implemented by UNIDO that focuses on support to the meat and dairy sectors in Lebanon. The title of the project is "Assistance to the Lebanese meat and milk-processing sector in their efforts to gain increased market access". The project will run until the end of December 2009 and has a budget of € 580.000. The project is part of UNIDO's Integrated Programme for Lebanon to enhance the competitiveness of the Lebanese industry, of which also the MACLE project is part. There is a strong need for close cooperation with the Sustaining Quality Project, because there was a large measure of overlap between the initial formulation of the new project (dating from 2004) and the ToR of the Sustaining Quality, especially on issues of food safety regulation. The Director of the Quality Programme acts as focal point for this project. Moreover, the office of the new project is located in the Quality Programme, so that a close coordination can easily be realised.

External political environment

The implementation of the Quality Programme coincided with an unfortunate period in the recent history of Lebanon. Shortly after the start of the programme, on 14 February 2005, former Prime Minister Rafik Hariri was assassinated. This event set off a whole complex of other events. First it led to major shifts in the political climate, the departure of the Syrian army and a change in government after elections. Later, it led to events aiming at destabilisation of the country and its political system. Most prominent among them were the murders on a number of Lebanese political, intellectual and military leaders (Samir Kassir, George Hawi, Gebran Tueni, Piere Gemayel, Walid Eido, Antoine Ghanem, and François Hajj). Also a string of bomb attacks and other forms of violent civil unrest (mass demonstrations, riots, fierce fighting between the Lebanese Army and Palestinian insurgents) took place during the whole implementation period of the project. The political situation deteriorated after the resignation of six ministers in November 2006. The standoff between the political blocs in the country was aggravated from December 2006 onwards and has led to the incapacity of the Parliament, a major element in the legislative process. In the second half of 2007 the political crisis deepened even further as the deadline for the election of a new president of the republic approached without parties being able to reach an early agreement. The beginning of May 2008 saw a sudden deterioration in the situation with an upsurge in violence and street fighting. However, the internationally brokered Doha agreement brought a surprisingly quick end to hostilities and, more importantly, also solutions to a number of national political issues. The election of a president, the formation of a national unity government and agreement on a political agenda of the new cabinet has led to the resumption of the work of the main political institutions.

However, the most serious interruption, which the programme encountered, was the devastating attack on Lebanon by Israel in July and August of 2006. The war and its aftermath had a distinctive impact on the implementation of the Quality Programme.

Effects on the Programme

The political situation has created a real sense of crisis among the population accompanied by a feeling of insecurity. This situation was not conducive to the

smooth implementation of the Quality Programme. Effects ranged from people not showing up at training courses, to cancellation of meetings and visits, to deferral of decisions. It has inevitably led to postponement and rescheduling of a number of activities, creating some level of delay in the planned project time schedule. Some of the activities of the Quality Programme focused on creating a proper legislative framework for the quality infrastructure institutions. As a consequence of the political situation, with a Parliament not being in session for more than a year, these activities could not be realised according to planning. One of the most noticeable fallouts of the political crisis was the closure of the Central Public Health Laboratory. This laboratory, one of the selected beneficiaries of the programme, was closed for security reasons on the order of the Internal Security Forces, because it was next to the house of one of the leading politicians in the country.

From a project management point of view, such effects were manageable; they did not create insurmountable problems. However, the effects of the summer war of 2006 on the programme were more severe.

That war coincided with probably the most critical phase in the Quality Programme, the completion of all tendering procedures. The failure of six smaller tenders can be fully attributed to this war. The consequence was that a number of planned activities could no longer be realised due to lack of means and equipment. It also caused a delay of several months in the implementation of the Quality Programme. The planned deliveries of equipment were hindered by the blockage of the Lebanese ports and airport for a couple of months after the ceasefire, followed by heavy congestion in the ports, the airport and at the customs for another couple of weeks.

The contract for training and consultancy services, managed by Gruppo Soges offers another example in this respect. This contract required an input of about 3000 days for consultancy and training to be delivered in a period of fifteen months. It was scheduled to come into effect during September 2006 and run until November 2007. As a direct consequence of the war, the mobilisation of experts went very slowly. Some experts had taken up additional short-term assignments, while awaiting the start of their work in the Quality Programme, leading to further delays in their availability, while other experts did not come at all. Many countries issued negative travel advices for Lebanon, reducing the ability and/or willingness of technicians and consultants to come to Lebanon. Such negative travel advices from some European countries have for a long time hindered the implementation of the programme, as exemplified by the refusal of German accreditation bodies to come to Lebanon for security reasons, even in 2008. Consequently, the actual implementation did only start in January 2007. This reduced the effective period from fifteen months to a less than eleven months, and it became clear that not all tasks could be accomplished in full during this period.

The potential loss of a substantial part of the planned inputs was reason for MoET to request the EU to extend the implementation period. This extension was granted and with the exception of the activities in budget line 1 (Tecnitas technical assistance contract), the other activities of the Quality Programme continued until the end of August 2008. The reason not to proceed with the Tecnitas contract in the same way was the fact that almost all planned resources were used by the end of December 2007. This problem was however covered by the creation of the Sustaining Quality project, which enabled the team of long-term advisers to continue their work, while at the same time adding some new activities.

3.2 Objectives achieved

This section deals with the objectives of the Quality Programme.

With regard to activities, the next section (3.3) offers an extensive presentation of the results planned in the Overall Work Plan, the activities that were actually performed during the implementation period and our estimate to what extent the planned results were realised by these activities.

The following table presents the objectives. The first column gives the objectives as formulated in the Financing Agreement and the second column the translation of these objectives into the Overall Work Plan, while the third column gives our observations and judgments on the level of achievement.

As conclusion, it can be stated that, with regard to the specific objectives, definitively progress has been made. Although the progress has not been even in all fields, a distinctive momentum has been created among the business community, in the quality infrastructure institutions and to a lesser degree among the public sector.

In the Enterprise Component major successes were achieved with the introduction of ISO 9001 and 22000 quality management systems in companies and with increasing the awareness in both the private and public sector through a complete palette of activities. That contributed to the fact that now targeted groups of "Lebanese producers are aware of quality needs and have introduced and applied quality requirements in their production processes and products" (and more will follow).

In the Institutional Development Component progress has been made in the fields of standardisation, testing and metrology. The national standardisation institute, LIBNOR, is changing its approach to standardisation, putting it in line with the current international best practice and has started with its integration into the international community for standardisation. The capacity for product testing has considerably increased through the supply of equipment and training. All thirteen actively participating laboratories are making good progress towards the implementation of quality management systems and about six of them are in the process of acquiring an internationally recognised accreditation. That will be a genuine benefit for enterprises and government agencies. For the area of metrology a modest beginning has been made with building capacities for some real calibrations of instruments, something that was barely present in Lebanon for many years. One cannot say that "the Lebanese conformity assessment infrastructure is complete and operating adequately", but some good progress has been made and it can definitively be completed in the near future.

With regard to the Policy Component a general policy framework for approaching and dealing with issues of promoting a quality culture and developing a quality infrastructure has been prepared through the National Quality Policy. Also the legal framework for the quality infrastructure has been completely developed. However, it is not "in place", but ready to be put in place once the political situation in the country will be normalised again.

With the Ministry of Economy and Trade there is now, as a consequence of the project, a much better understanding of the issues related to the development of a modern quality infrastructure. There is a limited group of persons with experience in these matters and with exposure to ongoing international developments in the field.

As a general remark, it should be stated that the objectives were formulated and defined in very generic terms. They are therefore stating demanding goals, because a very broad situation has to be covered. This signifies in our opinion the long-term approach that is necessary to attain these objectives. Therefore, the Quality Programme should only be considered as a starting point, or take-off phase. Such a long-term approach is in the meantime recognised by the EU through the fact that a new project has been granted ('Sustaining Quality') to take on a number of new aspects of the quality infrastructure and to continue with the previous activities. This project extends the Quality Programme with another 18 months. For the period thereafter, the EU has clearly indicated that it wants to continue with the Quality Programme for another few years, bringing the total period up to eight years. That is indeed a long-term and viable approach.

FINANCING AGREEMENT	OVERALL WORK PLAN	OBSERVATIONS
OVERALL OBJECTIVE	OVERALL OBJECTIVE	
To increase the share of Lebanese products and services in international trade through better conformance with technical requirements and international standards. The safety and health of local population will be better protected by quality control of imported and locally manufactured products.	<p>Improve and develop the major functions of the Lebanese conformity assessment Infrastructure</p> <p>Seek to align Lebanese practices to match EU regulations, in the field of standardisation, testing, certification and inspection and accreditation</p> <p>Develop a quality approach for local manufacturers, in relation to increasing the quality and safety of Lebanese products and encouragement of Lebanese export opportunities</p>	<p>Within the Logical Framework Approach, it should be possible to attain the overall objective, if the specific objectives and other conditions (assumptions) are fulfilled. Although there has been definitively progress on the specific objectives, it is clear that they are not accomplished in full and consequently the progress towards the overall objective has been rather limited.</p> <p>However, for a large part one can say that the external environment of the programme has changed during the implementation period. It is difficult to establish, if the share of Lebanese goods and service in international trade has gone up, when the exports have plummeted after the summer war of 2006. It is difficult to assume that basic legislation is functioning, when it is not there in the first place and it could not move on, because Parliament was not functioning. In other words, the external circumstances have not been conducive to support the outcomes and achievements of the Quality Programme in a much stronger way.</p>
SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES	SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES	
	<p>General Objectives</p> <p>Increasing the institutional capacity building at MoET in creating a National Quality Policy and the enforcement of laws and technical regulations, in the field of Conformity Assessment</p> <p>Support for MoET in co-ordinating the development of each of the key technical functions and CA institutions</p> <p>Support for MoET in building awareness in the private sector</p>	<p>The “general specific objectives” are not so much objectives as disguised results and broad categories of activities. The capacity of MoET of dealing with quality issues in general has been improved as the result of the many activities described in the section on “Activities undertaken”.</p>
<p>Policy:</p> <p>The Lebanese government has a policy and legal framework in place for quality related issues and an adequately organised and operating system of market surveillance.</p>	<p>Policy:</p> <p>Building high standard capabilities at MoET in the field of Quality, through permanent technical international and local expertise attached to the Quality Unit</p>	<p>The Quality Programme activities have created a draft national quality policy and the draft of a complete legal framework, consisting of seven closely related laws, which will achieve in principle the formation and operation of a quality infrastructure comparable to best practices in the EU. Adoption of the quality policy and adoption of the proposed</p>

FINANCING AGREEMENT	OVERALL WORK PLAN	OBSERVATIONS
	<p>Aiming to support MoET in raising Lebanon's profile and level of response, in bilateral and multilateral trade</p>	<p>legislation will create the basis and the conditions for the further coherent development of the quality infrastructure in Lebanon. As such it has provided the first necessary phase for a full systems approach. Not so much as an objective of policy in itself, but primarily as a necessary condition to be able to formulate and implement polices and legislation, the capabilities of the Quality Unit of MoET have been build up. The staff of the Quality Unit has acquired a reasonably detailed understanding of the major elements of the quality infrastructure and the concept of quality. That makes it at least less demanding to respond to actions and requests coming from international trade related issues, like the Palermo process on the negotiation of ACAA's with the EU, or the membership negotiations with the WTO.</p>
<p>Institutions: The Lebanese conformity assessment infrastructure is complete and operating adequately.</p>	<p>Institutional: Improvement of the Lebanese conformity assessment infrastructure, in order to adequately respond to national needs Recognition of authoritative international bodies and achievement of mutual recognition agreements</p>	<p>The Lebanese conformity assessment infrastructure is far from complete and therefore not yet operating adequately, but there are noticeable improvements in some sections. Recognition by authoritative international bodies and the achievement of mutual recognition agreements are the final pieces in the whole process and should be considered as the ultimate proof of the success of the system. Improvements have been made in the field of standardisation through the gradual turnaround in the operations of the national standardisation institute and its growing connections to the international standardisation community. Improvements have also been made in the field of testing laboratories where the variety of available testing methods has been increased and some major laboratories have reached a higher level of proficiency through the application of laboratory quality management systems. A very modest beginning has been made in the sector of metrology, where for the first time in the country some proper calibrations can now be made. Inspection and certification were outside the scope of activities of the Quality Programme and accreditation did not actually move forward due to the effects of national crises on the political decision making.</p>
<p>Enterprise: Lebanese producers are aware of quality needs and introduce and apply quality requirements in their production processes and products.</p>	<p>Enterprise: To ensure that priority and importance given to quality, is reflected in the skills and technical capabilities of the private sector To clearly establish and secure the</p>	<p>The Quality Programme has undoubtedly contributed to increasing the awareness of the business sector and also of some parts of the public sector on the importance and benefits of quality and quality management. Nevertheless, the measurable impact of the Quality Programme is rather limited. The project does only have a real bearing on small group of companies that have actively participated in training</p>

FINANCING AGREEMENT	OVERALL WORK PLAN	OBSERVATIONS
	<p>commitment of all stakeholders in developing an effective and reliable quality and conformity assessment system</p>	<p>and/or consultancy activities. In that group the skills and technical capabilities have improved and quality management systems are being applied, as demonstrated through the number of companies with certified systems. The Quality Programme has demonstrated to be a very efficient mechanism for delivering training and consultancy with a high added-value level.</p> <p>This group and a somewhat wider group that has participated in training activities are the nucleus of the business community on which to build the further dissemination of the quality concept. They are the role models and beacons that other companies and institutions should learn from and they will be the core group for the first national quality award.</p>

3.3 Activities Undertaken

In this section the relationship between the planned results, the activities undertaken and the achievements of the Quality Programme, will be demonstrated.

All activities that took place during the Quality Programme were based on an approved Overall Work Plan (included in the Inception Report) and on approved Annual Work Plans.

At the request of the ECD this report is based on the structure of the Inception Report and therefore actually the first Work Plan (AWP1). That request poses some serious problems in the presentation of results, because the structure of the second and third Work Plans differs notably from the first. Some activities undertaken in the later parts of the Quality Programme and results achieved may not have a clear and direct reference in the Inception Report. There were at the time two major reasons for a certain measure of restructuring the work plans (quotations from AWP2):

“Where AWP1 focused on the start-up phase of the Programme and Project and on a number of important preliminary activities, such as the preparation of the major tender dossiers, AWP2 and AWP3 will be much more concerned with actual implementation.”

“Another difference between AWP2 and AWP3 on the one hand and AWP1 on the other hand is a streamlining in the activities. In AWP1 some activities of similar nature and character were rather fragmented over the different components, especially in relation to “awareness”, to what is now called ‘education and technology’, and to all activities concerning the supply of information. In AWP2, they are now grouped together as one item and put in the Enterprise Component.”

In other words, the OWP (annex AWP1) was rather fuzzy and repetitive and does not well reflect all the work to be done in the programme.

As a consequence, there will be substantial differences in the way the results are presented here and in most of the previous reporting of the Quality Programme.

For the sake of understanding, the following table makes a comparison between the activities in AWP1 and their numbering and the activities in AWP2/AWP3 and their numbering. It also provides in the last column some reasons why the changes between AWP1 and AWP2 were made. For the Policy Component and the Institutional Component the comparison it is not too difficult, but for the Enterprise Component any meaningful comparison becomes rather complicated.

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
POL A	ELABORATION OF NATIONAL QUALITY POLICY	POL A	NATIONAL QUALITY POLICY	
POL A1	Define short term and long term goals	POL A1	Design and Development of the National Quality Policy	New title, covers better the activities
POL A2	Study tours for analysing similar policies in other countries			Completed under AWP1 Deleted, because not a separate activity as such, but means to an end
POL A3	Public Awareness campaign /preparation of documents (action managed by Enterprise Component)	POL A2	Support to the implementation of the National Quality Policy	New title, covers better the activities
POL A4	Support to QAC through dedicated workshops or specific STE assistance			Deleted due to lack of interest from QAC members
POL A5	Elaboration of incentive plans for supporting companies on their way to quality			Completed in AWP1
POL A6	Study to identify R&D needs for applying new technologies in high priority sectors			Completed in AWP1
POL A7	Begin quality courses at schools and universities / vocational institutions	POL A3	Support to quality activities in education (joint activity with ENT D)	New title, covers better the activities
POL B	ASSESSMENT OF EXISTING QUALITY RELATED STRUCTURES	POL B	QUALITY RELATED STRUCTURES	
POL B1	Identify role and responsibilities of ministries in the conformity assessment field	POL B1	Roles and responsibilities of ministries and other government institutions in technical regulations and conformity assessment	New title, covers better the activities
POL B2	Planning solutions to avoid overlapping	POL B2	Mutually exclusive system of responsibilities of ministries and institutions in technical regulations and conformity assessment	New title, covers better the activities
POL B3	Gap analysis in relation to EU countries	POL B3	Comparative analysis of Lebanese and EU countries system of technical regulations and conformity assessment	New title, covers better the activities
POL C	CAPACITY BUILDING FOR MOET AND OTHER CONCERNED MINISTRIES	POL C	CAPACITY BUILDING AT MOET AND OTHER MINISTRIES	
POL C1	Create a quality Task Force of concerned ministries			Deleted. Integrated part of POL A1 and POL A2
POL C2	Define common working procedures			Deleted. Integrated part of POL A1, POL A2 and POL B3

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
POL C3	Awareness seminars and training courses for task force members	POL C1	Training courses and study tours for ministry staff involved in development and implementation of quality policy	New title, covers better the activities
POL C4	Creating a library at MoET	POL C2	Library on quality and conformity assessment at MoET	
POL C5	Introduction of 9001 QMS in the Quality Unit at MoET	POL C3	Introduction of an ISO 9001 quality management system in the Quality Unit	
POL C6	Use the pilot experience at MoET for running similar applications of 9001 QMS in other ministries	POL C4	Use the experience from the pilot project at the Quality Unit to disseminate to other ministries	
POL D	REVIEW OF LEGAL FRAMEWORK	POL D	REVIEW OF LEGAL FRAMEWORK	
POL D1	Collection and analysis of all documents, regulations and procedures related to CA			Completed in AWP1
POL D2	Creation of a database for filling all documents plus development of an interactive software for developing suitable links with other related databases			Completed in AWP1. Maintenance of the database is POL B1 and in ENT C (Technical Support Centre)
POL D3	Training courses for legal draftsmen on rules and procedures in drafting laws			Completed in AWP1
POL D4	Review of CA draft laws	POL D1	Review of legal framework relating to technical regulations and conformity assessment	New title, covers better the activities
		POL D2	Development of technical regulations	New activity aiming at implementation of legislation
POL E	ENHANCEMENT OF MARKET SURVEILLANCE	POL E	MARKET SURVEILLANCE	
POL E1	Review of legislation governing Market Surveillance			The two separate projects for market surveillance were started (Twinning Project and Municipalities Project) reducing the need for large scale activity in this field from the Quality Programme
POL E2	Revision of newly adopted approach			idem
POL E3	Training of assessors and inspectors on EU procedures			idem
POL E4	Training of assessors and inspectors on new procedures			idem
POL E5	Study tours in 5 priority sectors			idem

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
POL E6	Adopt new procedures and working methods			idem
		POL E1	Feasibility study on export certification agency and its possible implementation	Newly defined activity
		POL E2	Support to Market Surveillance activities and legal metrology not covered in the Twinning Project	Newly defined activity
		POL E3	Training of inspectors and assessors supplementary to the Twinning Project	Newly defined activity
POL F	CREATING AN INFORMATION CENTRE			
POL F1	Create a comprehensive database of adopted standards, technical regulations and conformity assessment procedures linked to the existing databases of LINBOR, IRI, etc.	ENT C1		Due to the large measure of overlap with the planned activities for an Information Centre that was also in the in the Enterprise Component, these activities have been joined and placed in the Enterprise Component (ENT C new)
POL F2	Maintain a high level of awareness, evaluating solutions applied abroad through study tour in 2 countries			idem
POL F3	Maintain a high level of awareness, training of staff on selected solutions applied abroad			idem
POL G	PROMOTE PURCHASE OF QUALITY GOODS AND SERVICES			
POL G1	Study to encourage the use of quality products			Due to the character of this activity it was deemed to fit better with the awareness activities in the Enterprise Component (ENT B)
INS A	EXISTANCE OF A FULLY DEVELOPED NATIONAL METROLOGY NETWORK	INS A	THE LEBANESE NATIONAL METROLOGY NETWORK	
INS A1	Preparing traceability needs analysis			Completed in AWP1
INS A2	Developing inventory of existing structures with a role in national metrology			Completed in AWP1
INS A3	Supporting the establishment of a Lebanese metrology network	INS A1	Support to the Lebanese metrology network, including legal metrology	Bundling closely related activities
INS A4	Developing an overall plan for national metrology	INS A1	Support to the Lebanese metrology network, including legal metrology	Bundling closely related activities
INS A5	Selecting primary and reference laboratories for twinning/training and equipment support and sign agreements with each recipient			No twinning to be used Completed in AWP1

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
INS A6	Preparing detailed activities for twinning/training activities			No twinning to be used. Completed in AWP1
INS A7	Preparing detailed specifications of equipment			Completed in AWP1
INS A8	Undertaking initial training for primary and reference laboratories	INS A1	Support to the Lebanese metrology network, including legal metrology	Includes all remaining activities not related to equipment and training
INS A9	Tendering for twinning/training and equipment	INS A2	Procurement of equipment	INS A9 has been split in 2 separate activities for equipment and training, because of different procedures (supply contracts and service contracts) No twinning to be used
		INS A4	Procurement of training	idem
INS A10	Supporting implementation of twinning/training programme and the provision of equipment	INS A3	Preparing installation and installation of equipment	For the same reason the follow up has also been split over 2 activities
		INS A5	Supporting implementation of training programmes	For the same reason the follow up has also been split over 2 activities
INS B	IMPROVEMENT OF LABORATORY MANAGEMENT AND INTRODUCTION OF QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS	INS B	SUPPORTING TESTING AND CALIBRATION LABORATORIES	
INS B1	Preparing market/needs analysis for testing and calibration in selected priority areas/sectors			Completed in AWP1
INS B2	Developing inventory of existing structures (in conjunction with A2) and identify the role and responsibilities of Ministries in the CA field			Completed in AWP1
INS B3	Preparing testing and calibration laboratory investment guide			Completed in AWP1
INS B4	Developing laboratory networks (on the basis of the national metrology plan) and train potential applicants			Completed in AWP1
INS B5	Managing application procedures, selecting recipients on a competitive basis and signing contracts			Completed in AWP1
INS B6	Preparing detailed specifications of equipment for laboratories			Completed in AWP1
INS B7	Tendering equipment (including ongoing support to recipients)	INS B1	Procurement of equipment	Split into 2 activities, to be consistent with the approach in INS A

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
		INS B2	Preparing installation and installation of equipment	Split into 2 activities, to be consistent with the approach in INS A
INS B8	Providing laboratory management training	INS B3	Procurement of training	Split into 2 activities, to be consistent with the approach in INS A
INS B9	Providing training and assistance to develop laboratory quality systems	INS B4	Providing training and assistance to develop laboratory quality systems	Split into 2 activities, to be consistent with the approach in INS A
INS B10	Preparing accreditation process, test run accreditation cycles and achieve full accreditation for minimum of two laboratories	INS B5	Surveying the progress of quality systems in laboratories	New title, covers better the activities
INS C	FULL FUNCTIONING AND OPERATIONAL ACCREDITATION SCHEME	INS C	FUNCTIONING AND OPERATIONAL ACCREDITATION SCHEME	
INS C1	Support identifying the key partners and obtaining initial agreement for the Lebanese Accreditation Scheme			Not relevant any longer after the decision of the ECD not to use the twinning instrument, but service contracts instead
INS C2	Support and setting up an accreditation body and local network	INS C1	Support and setting up an accreditation body and local network	
INS C3	Planning training/twinning package involving one or several European accreditation bodies			No twinning to be used Completed in AWP1
INS C4	Tendering the training/twinning package	INS C2	Tendering the training package	No twinning to be used
INS C5	Providing initial training of accreditation body staff and assessors	INS C3	Providing training of accreditation unit staff and assessors	
INS C6	Supporting development of Lebanese inspection and certification bodies			Deleted due to problems with the operational status of COLIBAC
INS C7	Supporting Lebanese companies and organisations to become certified	ENT A2		Shifted to Enterprise Component as the "ISO-certification" project (ENT A2). Also to provide a better workload distribution between long-term advisers.
INS C8	Supporting implementation of training/twinning package	INS C4	Monitoring the progress of quality system development in laboratories	No twinning to be used
INS D	SUPPORT NATIONAL STANDARDS INSTITUTE TO REORGANISE AND TO IMPROVE ITS MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONAL CAPACITIES	INS D	SUPPORT NATIONAL STANDARDS INSTITUTE TO REORGANISE AND TO IMPROVE ITS MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONAL CAPACITIES	
INS D1	Conducting an analysis of enterprise needs, for information on national and international			Completed in AWP1

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
	standards			
INS D2	Preparing training and institutional twinning package			Completed in AWP1
INS D3	Tender training/twinning package	INS D1	Tender training package	No twinning to be used
		INS D3	Support to reorganisation of LIBNOR	After decision not to use twinning contracts, it was decided to use the standards body which was part of the Tecnicas consortium to support LIBNOR.
INS D4	Providing initial assistance to set up the Enquiry Point	INS D3	Support to reorganisation of LIBNOR	
INS D5	Supporting implementation of the training/twinning package	INS D2	Supporting implementation of training package	No twinning to be used Procurement of IT equipment to support the development and implementation of database applications, which are part of INS D1
ENT A	PRIVATE SECTOR WILL BE MUCH MORE AWARE OF THE ROLE AND IMPORTANCE OF QUALITY AND CONSUMER PROTECTION ISSUES	ENT B	IMPLEMENT AN AWARENESS CAMPAIGN, TARGETING THE PRIVATE SECTOR	
ENT A1	Agree target sectors, goals and enterprises	ENT A3	Carry out follow-up activities on the agreed target sectors, goals and enterprises to be targeted	All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
ENT A2	Design, produce & print a quarterly QUALEB Newsletter	ENT B1	Develop and expand the range of awareness support activities (including quarterly newsletter, ABC Quality Guide, Promotion flyers and merchandising)	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT A3	Develop a media communications strategy to target private sector companies	ENT B2	Expand the media communications strategy of the Quality Programme	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT A4	Develop and plan a series of QUALEB related conferences, seminars & round table meetings, on specific topics of relevance plus related Trade Shows	ENT B4	Design and specify a National Quality Day / Week and related conferences, seminars, round table meetings, including the annual Quality Company Award	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT A5	Design, produce & print flyers to be inserted in media packs	ENT B1	Develop and expand the range of awareness support activities (including quarterly newsletter, ABC Quality Guide, Promotion flyers and merchandising)	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT A6	Design promotional support materials for the project duration	ENT B1	Develop and expand the range of awareness support activities (including quarterly newsletter, ABC Quality Guide, Promotion flyers and merchandising)	All awareness related activities grouped together

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
ENT A7	Develop, publish and print a series of 'ABC Guide to' booklets	ENT B1	Develop and expand the range of awareness support activities (including quarterly newsletter, ABC Quality Guide, Promotion flyers and merchandising)	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT A8	Design a series of promotional activities to disseminate QUALEB activities to the wider Lebanese business and mass consumer market	ENT B4	Design and specify a National Quality Day / Week and related conferences, seminars, round table meetings, including the annual Quality Company Award	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT B	THE NEED FOR INFORMATION ON STANDARDS AND CONFORMITY ASSESSMENT PROCEDURES IS ASSESSED	ENT B	IMPLEMENT AN AWARENESS CAMPAIGN, TARGETING THE PRIVATE SECTOR	
ENT B1	Implement a comprehensive market research assignment to establish target sector company information needs and analysis of R & D capacities	ENT A3	Carry out follow-up activities on the agreed target sectors, goals and enterprises to be targeted	All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
ENT B2	Design and create a website, which is interactive for the Lebanese private sector, which provides value-added information, with direct links to key stakeholders and possibly a search engine to link up with European Directives	ENT B5	Further develop and up-date the Quality Programme interactive web-site	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT C	AN EFFECTIVE AWARENESS CAMPAIGN IS DEVELOPED, BASED ON THE OUTCOMES OF THE MARKET RESEARCH			
ENT C1	Establish a QUALEB presence at trade fairs and exhibitions	ENT B3	Further develop co-ordination activities with relevant NGOs, other donor aid programmes and expand participation at trade fairs / exhibitions	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT C2	Design and specify a National Quality Day/Week	ENT B4	Design and specify a National Quality Day / Week and related conferences, seminars, round table meetings, including the annual Quality Company Award	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT D	APPROPRIATE DELIVERY MECHANISMS FOR INFORMATION SERVICES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT OTHER EC CO-FINANCED ACTIVITIES ARE DEFINED AND DEVELOPED			
ENT D1	Identify 'Missionary companies/organisations' to work with QUALEB	ENT A2	Increase the knowledge of selected enterprises in Quality related issues through training and consultancy (including Food Hygiene management systems)	All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
ENT D2	Discussions and co-ordination with relevant NGOs	ENT B3	Further develop co-ordination activities with	All awareness related activities grouped together

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
			relevant NGOs, other donor aid programmes and expand participation at trade fairs / exhibitions	
ENT D3	Establish a QUALEB Information Centre, focusing on Conformity Assessment as a core issue, including identification and dissemination of European benchmarks and indicators	ENT C1	Further develop the establishment of the Quality Programme Technical Support Programme	
		ENT C2	Support the development of databases and supply of the relevant technical infrastructure	Newly designed activity in relation to acquiring the technical and operational infrastructure of the planned Technical Information Centre
ENT E	A KNOWLEDGE BASE FOR TECHNOLOGICAL IMPROVEMENTS AND INNOVATIONS AMONG LEBANESE ENTERPRISES AND UNIVERSITIES, IS DEVELOPED AND PROMOTED	ENT D	DEVELOP THE TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION KNOWLEDGE BASE AMONG LEBANESE ENTERPRISES AND EDUCATION PROVIDERS	
ENT E1	Create a 'Quality company of the Season' award, leading to 'Company of the Year' award	ENT B4	Design and specify a National Quality Day / Week and related conferences, seminars, round table meetings, including the annual Quality Company Award	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT E2	Develop strong links with university institutions	ENT D2	Enhance the linkages with Lebanese education providers	
ENT E3	Develop strong linkages with the Vocational education providers in Lebanon, including a possible booklet	ENT D2	Enhance the linkages with Lebanese education providers	
		ENT D3	Develop quality related training modules for primary, secondary, university and vocational training centres	Newly designed activity to strengthen the support to the educational sector with a set of tools
ENT E4	Establish an annual Student Quality Award, in relation to a quality thesis/project related issue	ENT B4	Design and specify a National Quality Day / Week and related conferences, seminars, round table meetings, including the annual Quality Company Award	All awareness related activities grouped together
ENT F	PRACTICAL LINKS BETWEEN COMPANY NEEDS AND THE SUPPLY OF RELEVANT TECHNOLOGICAL EXPERTISE, ARE ESTABLISHED	ENT D	DEVELOP THE TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION KNOWLEDGE BASE AMONG LEBANESE ENTERPRISES AND EDUCATION PROVIDERS	
ENT F1	Increase the quality knowledge of the enterprises	ENT D1	Increase the quality knowledge of the enterprises and develop practical technology packages for private sector enterprises	Innovation related activities grouped together
ENT F2	Analyse the R & D capacity of companies in agreed	ENT D1	Increase the quality knowledge of the enterprises	Innovation related activities grouped together

CODE AWP1	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1	CODE AWP2	ANNUAL WORK PLAN 2/3	REASON FOR CHANGES
	target sectors		and develop practical technology packages for private sector enterprises	
ENT G	LEBANESE NATIONAL QUALITY CENTRE IS ESTABLISHED WITH BROAD OUTREACH ACROSS THE PRIVATE SECTOR, TO DEVELOP AND DISSEMINATE BEST PRACTICE, QUALITY ADVICE, TRAINING AND BENCHMARKING, ACROSS ALL SECTORS OF INDUSTRY.	ENT A	ESTABLISH A LEBANESE NATIONAL QUALITY CENTRE	
ENT G1	Clearly define the steps to be taken, including a time frame, for the establishment of the 'Lebanese National Quality Centre'	ENT A1	Follow-up on the necessary steps, leading to the establishment of an independent 'Lebanese National Quality Centre'	All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
		ENT A2	Increase the knowledge of selected enterprises in Quality related issues through training and consultancy (including Food Hygiene management systems)	Former activity INS C7 All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
ENT G2	Create a Quality Club / Forum targeting the private sector	ENT A4	Create a Quality Club / Forum / XX Groups, targeting private sector enterprises	All business sector related activities (other than awareness) grouped together
ENT G3	Establish and disseminate European benchmarks and indicators	ENT C3	Identify, establish and disseminate European benchmarks and indicators	This activity was both in ENT D3 and in ENT G3. It was better placed in relation to the Technical Information Centre

The next table below represents the core of this Final Report.

It provides a listing of all activities planned in the Annual Work Plan no.1, which is incorporated in the Inception Report (section 3.4, pages 32 – 113).

In a few places some activities have been added. These are the ones that were added as new activities in the AWP2 and AWP3. Together, they encompass all activities performed during the implementation period of the Quality Programme between October 2004 and August 2008.

The first column gives the codes number for the activities.

The second column has the name of the activity and directly under it the expected outputs as formulated in the Inception Report.

The third column provides information over the actual activities that were performed for, or can be related to the realisation of the outputs.

The fourth column gives the results of the activities and that will make it possible to compare planned to realised results. Moreover, in this column are also listed the specific problems encountered that hampered the achievement of the original goals in completely or in part.

In column six we give our estimate of the level in which the planned outputs have been achieved by the realised results. This is done in the form of a percentage.

In the seventh and last columns we pay special attention to the sustainability of the results. Here we comment, where relevant, on the usefulness of activities and their continuation in the follow-up projects, Sustaining Quality and the planned second phase of the Quality Programme.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
POL A	ELABORATION OF NATIONAL QUALITY POLICY				
POL A1	Define short term and long term goals				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality Policy designed and documented Establish WG on Quality Policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 consecutive draft versions of national quality policy prepared with help of STE and STLE WG on Quality Policy established and several discussion meetings held 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Document with draft of national quality policy prepared <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Since beginning of 2007 there was in actual fact no operational manager for the Policy Component. The LTE Policy Adviser is also team coordinator and for most of his time engaged in activities for the management of the Quality Programme. <p>(See also Evaluation Report)</p>	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussions with other ministries and stakeholders to be organised as part of 'Sustaining Quality' project. Approval of the draft National Quality Policy by the Council of Ministers Regular updates of the National Quality Policy on a bi-annual basis. To be continued during the Quality Programme Second Phase. Implementation of the national Quality Policy will be one of the major responsibilities of the Quality Unit at MoET
POL A2	Study tours for analysing similar policies in other countries				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase capacities of Quality Unit staff by making 2 study tours to EU and/or MEDA countries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 study tours performed to learn about quality policies in other countries (Morocco, France and Ukraine) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality Unit staff gained knowledge on the approach to quality in 3 different countries. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff of Quality Unit needs to keep itself informed about ongoing international developments, viz. through participation in international activities.
POL A3	Public Awareness campaign /preparation of documents (action managed by Enterprise Component)				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information document on agreed national quality policy Articles and information to be published in QUALEB Newsletter PowerPoint presentation on the NQP 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No major activities because this activity is the follow-up of activity POL A1, which was not fully completed. A general seminar on accreditation was given by ISTE. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff from different ministries acquainted with the principles of accreditation. 	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support to the actual implementation of the national quality policy should be one of the continuing key elements of the follow-up projects. Publication of the National Quality Policy is foreseen during the Sustaining Quality Project as one of the ABC guides.
POL A4	Support to QAC through dedicated workshops or specific STE assistance				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assistance of STE to address specific 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QAC formed and held regular 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The QAC served as an extended 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A smaller steering committee could

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> questions arising from QAC Thematic workshops for QAC members on NQP Document selection and assembly in support of QAC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> meetings (8 meetings in total) There was no need among the members of the QAC for the kind of support planned. Therefore, the activity was not performed Organisational (ISTE) and technical (LSTE) structure designed for a database for the collection of documents. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> steering committee for the project. Database structure developed 		probably be more effective in terms of providing close guidance to the development of a project.
POL A5	Elaboration of incentive plans for supporting companies on their way to quality				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two study tours Proposal for an incentive plan for supporting companies in the introduction of quality in their processes Increased capacity building of the Quality Unit staff Gain direct exposure to European best practice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A study report on incentive schemes has been prepared by ISTE and LSTE, including examples of such scheme in several EU countries and recommendations of Lebanon 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A study report on incentive schemes has been prepared by ISTE and LSTE, including examples of such scheme in several EU countries and recommendations of Lebanon 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposal to be reconsidered for final version of the national Quality Policy
POL A6	Study to identify R&D needs for applying new technologies in high priority sectors				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identification of new technology needs Proposal for application of R&D solutions in priority sectors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A study report on incentive schemes has been prepared by ISTE and LSTE, including examples of such scheme in several EU countries and recommendations of Lebanon 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A study report on incentive schemes has been prepared by ISTE and LSTE, including examples of such scheme in several EU countries and recommendations of Lebanon 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The application of new technology should not be a prime concern of the Quality Programme. This area belongs much more in the scope of the ELCIM project. However, indirectly the Quality Programme has an interest in the development of new products, services, processes and procedures, because they are the possible outcomes of continuous business improvement strategies. Striving for business excellence will have a major influence on the propensity to innovate. The introduction of quality management systems is but a first step to continuous improvement. Further action in the direction of

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
					innovative business (excellence) models needs to be included in the future Quality Programme.
POL A7	Begin quality courses at schools and universities / vocational institutions				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposal for the involvement of schools and universities in the quality scheme • Awareness workshops at universities / vocational institutions • Definition of key elements for university course on quality 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study on quality (management) courses provided at secondary and tertiary educational institutions completed with recommendations for new courses to be added. • Delivery of a series of awareness seminars to a small number of Universities (2) and Vocational Education Institutions (5) on the theme of 'Innovation and Care', in line with the European Quality Week 2007. (See ENT E2) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since AWP2 this activity has been transferred to ENT D3 (See there) <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tender for Additional Training failed. The development of courses was supposed to take place through this tender 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See ENT D2/D3, as this activity was divided over POL and ENT activities
POL B	ASSESSMENT OF EXISTING QUALITY RELATED STRUCTURES				
POL B1	Identify role and responsibilities of ministries in the conformity assessment field				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports on meetings with Ministries and public/private organisations • Flow chart showing roles and responsibilities of ministries in the CA field underlying any areas of actual overlap or potential overlap. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WG on Conformity Assessment established and data provided by members. • Updating and expanding information on technical regulations from different sources through several STLE assignments • Development and realisation of technical structure of database and connection to QUALEB website developed • Database filled with available information • Information gathered by the ACAA working group 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As much information as possible gathered for inclusion in database. • Technical structure of database developed • Information classified for input in database. • Database operational as of December 2007 (for time being only internally, not yet linked to QUALEB website for public consultation) <p>Constraints:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The quality of the data gathered is rather poor for anything more than the simplest of databases. The idea proposed at several places in the Inception Report of having full electronic databases to be used as support to policy making, appeared 	60%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A complete mapping of the responsibilities of ministries for products and groups of products is a difficult task. The present collection of data on technical regulations is extensive, but we dare not state that it is complete. • During the Sustaining Quality project a new survey of the recent technical regulations will be performed. • Knowledge of current technical regulations is important for two reasons. With the introduction of a new technical regulations system, it is imperative to know which regulations concerning specific products are in force in order to be able to repeal them. Secondly, when designing new market surveillance

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			with hindsight to be beyond reality. See also remark POL D1.		<p>organisations one needs to know for which technical regulations they will bear responsibility.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • These mapping activities should be a continuous concern of the follow-up projects of the Quality Programme, because this information is not available in any systematic form anywhere else in Lebanon.
POL B2	Planning solutions to avoid overlapping				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study tour • Proposal for better distribution of tasks among Ministries concerned with CA • Each ministry to be informed and become aware of its role and responsibilities • Co-operation among Ministries in the field of CA 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WG on Conformity Assessment established and several meetings held for discussion of topic 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No major achievements. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity is follow-up of POL B1, which needs to provide the basic data • For effective implementation a proposed scheme should be incorporated in the national quality policy. It requires discussion and willingness among ministries to reshuffle their activities and responsibilities. And that requires an authoritative decision at the highest level of government. The quality policy would be the right place and instrument for it. However, the dilemma is that this would hold up the completion of the national quality policy. 	15%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This task will be carried forward into the 'Sustaining Quality' project. The proposed work on defining the scope of the Lebanese Food Safety Agency in relation to the tasks of other market surveillance inspectorates, will lead to a proposal for a coherent system of controls. The question of "who controls what" touches the core elements of responsibilities of ministries for conformity assessment. It needs to be clear what each of the market surveillance bodies is doing before effective technical assistance can be offered to them in a follow up project.
POL B3	Gap analysis in relation to EU countries				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the capacity building and the exposure of MoET staff and other stakeholders to relevant EU experiences • Successful CA experiences in EU countries are adopted to avoid overlapping 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gap analysis of Quality Infrastructure performed, comparing current Lebanese system with EU system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report with findings comparing Lebanon to the EU in matters of conformity assessment 	100%	
POL C	CAPACITIY BUILDING FOR MOET AND OTHER CONCERNED MINISTRIES				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
POL C1	Create a quality Task Force of concerned ministries				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establish contacts with key persons at concerned ministries in the CA field Establishment of a Quality Task Force 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Working Group on Conformity Assessment formed. Several meetings held, especially in the beginning of the project 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contacts established with key contact persons in other ministries 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> WG will possibly be reactivated for discussions with other ministries on the national quality policy and its implementation
POL C2	Define common working procedures				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Common working procedures defined Cooperation on work on CA processes at different ministries Increased knowledge on the importance of QMS in public offices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some discussions on procedures in the WG on Conformity Assessment, in particular tahine and halawa. Discussions in the ACAA working group 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No effective output achieved in terms of common procedures 	20%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Modernising and streamlining procedures is a task that could better be dealt with, if and when the general basic structure for technical regulations is in place (draft law on technical regulations). This type of work is foreseen for the second phase of the Quality Programme
POL C3	Awareness seminars and training courses for task force members				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training courses, seminars and workshops delivered Capacity building of task force members upgraded Task force able to carry out its duties and responsibilities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training course on Project cycle management Training course for civil servants dealing with drafting laws, on rules and procedures in EU legislation Training course on accreditation Workshop on tahina and halawa sectors (in cooperation with UNIDO) Full participation of QUALEB staff in all training activities organised within the Quality Programme 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB staff has acquired in general an acceptable level of understanding of quality issues. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Failure of tender for international missions does not allow any study tours Failure of tender for seminars does not allow venues Failure of tender for additional training limits availability of courses and trainers 	60%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Education and training of staff is a permanent issue, one that will be carried forward into the 'Sustaining Quality' project and then following second phase of the Quality Programme. There is also a need to enlarge the target group to persons in other ministries dealing with matters of quality and conformity assessment. This should take place in the upcoming second phase of the Quality Programme. It is not possible in the Sustaining Quality project due to severe budgetary constraints for this kind of activity.
POL C4	Creating a library at MoET				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creation of a library in the Quality Unit at MoET Increasing the capacity building of Quality Unit staff in handling input and sources of information, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Books, journals and standards selected and purchased through a number of small supply contracts Books registered and catalogued and available for use. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB library contains about 500 books, 80 international standards and subscriptions to 6 journals 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promotion of the use of the library to persons and organisations outside MoET, among others through QUALEB website, should be a more or less (low level) permanent activity.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	important to the task				
POL C5	Introduction of 9001 QMS in the Quality Unit at MoET				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress reports on the implementation of a QMS in the Quality Unit Certification of the Quality Unit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB quality manager appointed QUALEB staff with the help of two interns drafted the quality manual and working procedures, taking into account the dual aspects of QUALEB as a public service organisation and as a project organisation International consultant guided the QUALEB staff in developing and implementing the QMS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality manual completed and procedures implemented QUALEB quality management system certified by French certification body AFAQ in April 2008 QUALEB was first public body in Lebanon to achieve ISO 9001 certification <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A project to develop a quality management system for the MoET as a whole (financed from Support to the AA programme) cut across the initial planned activities. This project was not further pursued after a some months, and therefore caused only delay. The first consultant to guide QUALEB on the development of its QMS was dismissed and replaced by an international consultant. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB needs to keep applying the internal quality control procedures in a consistent manner, with yearly control visits from the certification body. Consequent application should eventually lead to better and improved servicing of the clients/stakeholders.
POL C6	Use the pilot experience at MoET for running similar applications of 9001 QMS in other ministries				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Application of quality documents to other ministerial units Dissemination of info documents on the application of ISO 9001 to governmental offices 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contacts with other government organisations within the scope of QUALEB to stimulate them to endeavour in quality management Two other governmental organisations (LIBNOR and Consumer Protection Directorate at MoET) participated in the Quality Programme's ISO-certification project 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> LIBNOR became second public organisation with certified ISO 9001 quality management system. CPD described working procedures and prepared a full quality manual. <p><u>Constraint:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Availability of resources (qualified staff and funds to pay the certification and yearly fees and control visits) put a limit on the achievements of CPD. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is large potential for improvement of services in Lebanese government institutions. Measurement of service quality and customer satisfaction and the introduction of quality management on a wider scale in the ministries is an activity which should be further pursued. Quality is not only a matter for the private sector, but equally important for non-profit and public sectors. Quality management in the public sector is a subject proposed for the second phase of the Quality Programme.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
POL D	REVIEW OF LEGAL FRAMEWORK				
POL D1	Collection and analysis of all documents, regulations and procedures related to CA				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most legislation and documents on CA are assembled in MoET 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legal texts have been collected (among others with the help of the members of the WG on Conformity Assessment) • Two STLE missions (2005 and 2007) to update the available information. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collection of legal texts related to technical regulations and conformity assessment <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is still no collection of legal texts that is neither easy accessible, nor complete. Even ministries are not aware of all the regulations that are supposed to be in their scope of activity. • Too many database activities defined within the initial setup of the Quality Programme and with too high level of expectation (See also POL B1, POL F1, INS D4 and ENT D3). • Databases are only as good as the quality of the inputs. Most of the inputs are not available in full electronic format; sometimes only as scanned copies of printed texts. That limits the type of information to be elicited. It puts also severe limits on the expected linking of databases, because some collections of data only exist on paper, or in not so easily compatible formats. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collecting and updating information on technical regulations and conformity assessment (and therefore also on roles of ministries and market surveillance bodies) has to be a continuous activity within the Quality Unit. Within the Sustaining Quality project another update of information by STLE is planned. • Once the Law on Technical Regulations has been adopted the problem of data collection will be solved to a large extent. All ministries will be under the legal obligation to notify the national committee for technical regulations on any technical regulation that they want to implement.
POL D2	Creation of a database for filling all documents plus development of an interactive software for developing suitable links with other related databases				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Database with specific CA indicators • Interactive software with other database links in place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A database created and filled with available information (See POL D1) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Database is in existence <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Database has limited functionality due the nature of available data. Advanced search functions, interactive software and linkages with 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See POL D1

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			other databases are not yet possible. However, it is in principle possible to address the search function through a web-based application,		
POL D3	Training courses for legal draftsmen on rules and procedures in drafting laws				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal draftsmen are trained on new EU rules and procedures to be incorporated in Lebanese laws 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training course delivered 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A limited group of legal persons from different ministries have a basic understanding of general principles of EU legislation and New Approach to technical regulation. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> More extensive 3 day training on technical regulations and conformity assessment is planned in the Sustaining Quality project. It is also proposed to include training on the implementation of specific EU directives in the second phase of the Quality Programme.
POL D4	Review of CA draft laws				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documents under the legal framework are analysed for their conformity All related draft laws are reviewed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All relevant laws, draft laws, and decrees concerning aspects of the Quality Infrastructure assessed, including the following laws and draft laws: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consumer Protection Food Safety Plant Quarantine Veterinary Quarantine Conformity Assessment Export Promotion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A general legal framework for conformity assessment and quality infrastructure, which is internally consistent and based on common terminology, is in existence. Final versions of the following laws have been drafted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Law on Standardisation Amendments to the Law on Accreditation Law on Metrology Law on General Product Safety and Market Surveillance Law on Technical Regulations and Conformity Assessment Law on Quality Infrastructure Rules for Liability of Defective Products <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The political situation in Lebanon from December 2006 onwards resulted in a deadlock in the functioning of Parliament for about 18 months. It was therefore not possible to forward any of the draft laws for final decision making. 	100%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
POL D2 (ADDED IN AWP2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A coherent and workable system of technical regulations and conformity assessment procedures is drafted and implemented. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities because this activity is the follow-up of activity POL D3 (POL D1 in AWP2). 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The design of technical regulations is dependent upon a law for technical regulations and conformity assessment procedures, which will set the general framework. Adoption by Parliament of this draft law was not possible during the Quality Programme (See POL D1). 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The prerequisite for drafting a coherent set of technical legislation, among others through the transposition of EU New Approach directives, is the adoption by Parliament of the Law on Technical Regulations. This draft law will set a general system, which makes it quite easy to adopt specific regulations within its framework. It is expected that the draft law may have been passed by Parliament during 2008. That would make it possible to start with drafting specific technical regulations during the second phase of the Quality Programme. If the draft law might for some reason not be passed by Parliament, transposition of EU New Approach directives as national technical regulations is still possible, but it would more cumbersome.
POL E	ENHANCEMENT OF MARKET SURVEILLANCE				
POL E1	Review of legislation governing Market Surveillance				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal framework for Market Surveillance is designed All Market Surveillance legislation is consolidated at MoET 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<p><u>Constraint:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> CPD Twinning Project and Municipalities Project on Market Surveillance were started. They dealt with much of the same subjects and in order to avoid duplication, these activities were left to these specialised projects. However some additional non overlapping activities were defined (See below the new POL E1, POL E2 and POL E3 activities adding in AWP2) 	0%	
POL E2	Revision of newly adopted approach				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Newly adopted approach to Market 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Idem 	0%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surveillance is reviewed New Approaches to Market Surveillance are suggested 				
POL E3	Training of assessors and inspectors on EU procedures				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inspectors and assessors are trained on EU rules and new approach procedures 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Idem 	0%	
POL E4	Training of assessors and inspectors on new procedures				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Updating training of technical staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Idem 	0%	
POL E5	Study tours in 5 priority sectors				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports on ongoing cooperation with EU and MEDA departments in charge of Market Surveillance in the selected sectors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Idem 	0%	
POL E6	Adopt new procedures and working methods				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Updated inputs on best practice adopted in EU of international countries Performance of Market Surveillance is enhanced 	No activities performed	Idem	0%	
POL E1 (ADDED IN AWP2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Feasibility study on export certification completed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> International short-term expert has performed the study on the implementation of a system of pre-export certification of products 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The study concluded that a system of certification of products before they are actually exported through an Export Certification Agency has no added value. The idea will not be further pursued. 	100%	
POL E2 (ADDED IN AWP2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Market surveillance activities supported 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussions with stakeholders held and potential activities in the field of hallmarking, measuring instruments and food and hygiene inspection identified. Hallmarking selected as prime target activity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plan for support to hallmarking defined (development of new legislation and support to assaying laboratories). A dozen regulations and procedures drafted for the control over measuring instruments and for pre-packaged goods. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p>	30%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All identified hallmarking experts not available in 2007. 		
POL E3 (ADDED IN AWP2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inspectors of market surveillance agencies, but in particular from the Ministry of Public Health, trained on basic procedures for inspection. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study on training needs within several market surveillance agencies by STLE and LSTE 8 training courses on basic food hygiene for inspectors and on practical inspection skills developed and delivered by ISTE and STLE 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 68 inspectors from different ministries trained in basic food hygiene 49 inspectors from different ministries trained in practical inspection skills Overview of training needs of all ministries involved in market surveillance 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The general professional knowledge of the average inspector is rather limited. Good market surveillance rests on knowledgeable and capable inspectors. Training of inspectors in a systematic way and as part of their career development is absolutely necessary. Within the follow-up projects the training programme will have to be established and in as far as possible (within the budgetary constraints) executed. Building a market surveillance system that makes sense and will be able to cope with the challenges posed by new developments and the increasing demand for consumer safety is a priority. Most market surveillance bodies have serious structural problems in terms of organisation, work planning, and execution of tasks in a professional manner, staffing, funding of operations, basic equipment, etc. A gradual, but more or less continuous support to build up and reorganise the bodies is necessary (adapted to the pace of absorption of the market surveillance bodies) during the follow up projects.
POL F	CREATING AN INFORMATION CENTRE				
POL F1	Create a comprehensive database of adopted standards, technical regulations and conformity assessment procedures linked to the existing databases of LINBOR, IRI, etc.				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A database of legal documentation on CA for use by local operators Database is linked to specialised 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A database of legal texts relating to technical regulations and conformity assessment has been created 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See observations in POL D1 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See POL D1

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	national and international bodies				
POL F2	Maintain a high level of awareness, evaluating solutions applied abroad through study tour in 2 countries				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreement with 2 Info Centres on exchange visits and information • Periodical reports on the status of the Centre 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • International expert made technical feasibility study and defined needs for IT equipment. (See also ENT D3) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through the completion of the technical feasibility study, it became apparent that the technical realisation of the idea is more complicated than initially assumed. It needs further clarification, especially on alternative approaches to data gathering and alternative organisational solutions. • Specifications of required IT equipment prepared as inputs for IT equipment tender. • <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Failure of the IT equipment tender did make the technical realisation of the Information Centre impossible 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the 'Sustaining Quality' project some attention will be given to the analysis of the real needs in this regard, while also alternative solutions will have to be looked into, such as combining the technical information centre with the Trade Information Centre at MoET, the Euro Information Centre at the Federation of Chambers of Commerce, or the future Export Promotion Board, or buying in into a foreign system.
POL F3	Maintain a high level of awareness, training of staff on selected solutions applied abroad				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capacity building for the information centre staff is increased • The information centre is operationally updated • 1 or 2 training courses on the latest solutions in the field are delivered 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No activities 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Failure of the IT equipment tender did make the technical realisation of the Information Centre impossible 	0%	
POL G	PROMOTE PURCHASE OF QUALITY GOODS AND SERVICES				
POL G1	Study to encourage the use of quality products				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A proposal for a promotion campaign in the NQP is presented 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No activities 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although the idea is sympathetic, implementation is problematic. The advice given by the government is either rather generic and has little added value, or it is product and 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good and reliable consumer information is largely absent in Lebanon.. It is normally a task associated with consumer organisations, but they are rather weak and lack the resources to

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			brand specific and one must be absolutely certain to advise pro or con a certain product.		do comparative testing and publishing monthly magazines, like the consumer organisation is the EU countries. It has been done for a short period of time and with limited scope through the newsletter of Consumers Lebanon. This was an EU funded activity It is an interesting subject, but would require a project on its own with funding for consumer organisations.
INS A	EXISTANCE OF A FULLY DEVELOPED NATIONAL METROLOGY NETWORK				
INS A1	Preparing traceability needs analysis				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Database of market needs • Specification of traceability chain • Identification and coordination of national Lebanese metrological standards • Identification of potential international primary laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A survey of the needs for calibration and testing carried out, which also included a survey of existing laboratory structures in order to uncover the metrological structures, including standards and reference materials. • A survey questionnaire was developed in co-operation with the Metrology Working Group and distributed to potential metrology laboratories • A clear separation of activities between testing laboratories on the one hand and calibration laboratories on the other hand, could not be maintained. A number of laboratories were active in both fields. Many activities have therefore been done jointly (See also INS B1) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overview of metrology laboratories, fields of activities and measuring instruments completed, as well as market needs 	100%	
INS A2	Developing inventory of existing structures with a role in national metrology				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A listing of committed laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See INS A1 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See INS A1 	100%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A draft list of existing equipment • Existing metrology structure indicating traceability to primary or national standards • An outline of industry needs to meet market expectations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assaying laboratories indentified and evaluated. Reorganisation of hallmarking system proposed as part of the development of legal metrology 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listing of equipment needs to fill gaps (currently existing and potential gaps in the near future) in testing and/or calibration activities • (See also INS B2) 		
INS A3	Supporting the establishment of a Lebanese metrology network				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Lebanese Metrology network bodies • Configuration of the metrology network • An EU metrology framework identified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Metrology Working Group was formed, which held 10 meetings for discussions on metrology needs and on the metrology network and on the draft metrology law. • ISTE have proposed a scheme for a Lebanese metrology network 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An outline of a Lebanese metrology structure <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No agreement existed between some of the major Lebanese players in the metrology area concerning the centralised or decentralised nature of the metrology system. Therefore, no conclusive arrangement was reached during the programme. 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The discussion on the metrology network is strongly linked to the discussion on the draft metrology law (See POL D). During the Sustaining Quality project the discussions in the WG on Metrology continued and the prospects for reaching an agreement on the issue are good. This agreed structure will be the basis for the draft law on metrology
INS A4	Developing an overall plan for national metrology				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A framework metrology plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ISTE worked on drafting some metrology regulations, especially in the field of legal metrology • An outline for a national metrology plan drafted 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A number of regulations and procedures for legal metrology drafted • Draft plan for national metrology function, including legal metrology <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There was no agreement among the major metrology players about the nature of the metrology infrastructure • During the implementation of the programme IRI received a large quantity of metrology equipment through another EU funded project. • An important part of the metrology related equipment was not delivered due to failure of the Additional Equipment tender and the failure of one lot with metrology equipment in the Supply tender. This reduced the cooperation of some of the 	80%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the Sustaining Quality project the metrology function will be further specified. A draft national metrology policy will be designed and a number of rules and procedures further developed, including the national metrology authorities. • In the second phase of the Quality Programme an effort will have to be made to make the metrology network operational and to train metrology inspectors.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			laboratories. Together with the previous point, it shifted the balance in the metrology system. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The legal metrology function is rather underdeveloped and lacks calibrated equipment and sufficient staff to operate and maintain the equipment. 		
INS A5	Selecting primary and reference laboratories for twinning/training and equipment support and sign agreements with each recipient				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Metrology expert committee formed List of selected, competent and committed laboratories Contracts signed with selected laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Metrology Working Group formed (See INS A3) Selection of calibration laboratories made Contracts prepared and signed with calibration laboratories participating in the programme for receiving equipment, training and consultancy No activity on twinning due to the fact that no twinning instrument was to be used. Instead technical specifications were developed for technical assistance to testing and calibration laboratories, as part of a large service contract for training and consultancy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5 laboratories selected for support in equipment, training and consultancy for ISO 17025 and preparation of accreditation Contracts signed with the 5 selected laboratories <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Given the state of development and the practical experience in the Lebanese metrology system, the idea of having primary and reference laboratories is simply an overestimate of the current situation. 	100%	
INS A6	Preparing detailed activities for twinning/training activities				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed laboratory specification document completed Approved international laboratory candidates for twinning identified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activity on preparation for twinning and selecting European twinning candidates due to the fact that no twinning instrument was to be used. Instead technical specifications were developed for technical assistance to testing and calibration laboratories, as part of a large service contract for training and consultancy (See INS A9). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete set of technical specifications for training and consultancy 	100%	
INS A7	Preparing detailed specifications of equipment				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A specified list of needed equipment • Detailed specifications of equipment to be procured 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed technical specifications written by ISTE's and LSTE's for 575 pieces of laboratory equipment, including metrology equipment • Separately specifications were prepared for a test stand for calibration of water meters 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The specifications have been used as inputs for the equipment tenders 	100%	
INS A8	Undertaking initial training for primary and reference laboratories				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 staff trained in uncertainty budgeting in Europe • 1 course held locally in uncertainty budgeting • 1 course covering laboratory quality assurance • Planning steps undertaken for laboratory accreditation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See INS B8 • The training and consultancy activities for testing laboratories and calibration laboratories were performed as one package, due to their similarity. Only a few specific training activities were done for calibration laboratories, especially in the field of determination of uncertainty levels of measurements. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See INS B8 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See INS B8
INS A9	Tendering for twinning/training and equipment				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tendering of twinning partners launched • Equipment received • Installation of specified equipment • Staff receive ongoing training on the use of the new equipment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 tender dossiers made for the purchase of laboratory equipment. In particular, the lots 2, 4 and 5 of the Supply Tender, and most of the Additional Equipment tender contained equipment for calibration. • Tenders launched and implemented according to EC procedural requirements • Evaluation of bids made • Contracts signed with winning suppliers • Contracts with laboratories signed on support for equipment, training and consultancy. • ISTE's and LSTE's supervised deliveries, installation, commissioning and training according to supply contracts. Provisional acceptance signed for all supply contracts • Supervising site preparations by laboratories according to MoET 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Equipment contracted and delivered <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not all planned metrology equipment could be contracted. One lot of the large equipment supply tender failed, as well as the complete additional equipment. No equipment for calibration of water flow meters, for calibrations of hardness, for calibration of dosimeters and one instrument for calibration of electrical quantities were supplied. As a consequence 2 out of the 5 calibration laboratories received no equipment at all and did no longer participate in the programme for this aspect. Another laboratory did get only part of the equipment and cannot do the planned calibrations. • Some laboratories were not ready with preparations of facilities at the 	100%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> contract with laboratories Inventory of training needs made and training modules designed related to new testing methods for laboratories. Tender dossier for the purchase of training and consultancy services prepared. Evaluation of bids made Contract signed with winning contractor. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> moment of arrival of equipment, which gave rise to delays Service contract for the delivery of training and consultancy services signed with a consortium, led by Gruppo Soges. 		
INS A10	Supporting implementation of twinning/training programme and the provision of equipment				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff updated Staff continuously updated until end of 2007 Periodically report on the status of the ongoing activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8 and INS B10 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8 and INS B10 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8 and INS B10
INS B	IMPROVEMENT OF LABORATORY MANAGEMENT AND INTRODUCTION OF QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS				
INS B1	Preparing market/needs analysis for testing and calibration in selected priority areas/sectors				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Specific configuration of laboratory needs, for export trade List of equipment needs for the laboratories, completed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Visits to identified laboratories Questionnaire prepared and send to laboratories Analysis of results providing an overview of gaps in testing capabilities in relation to export needs, market surveillance needs and the technical capacities of the laboratories Discussions with laboratory working group on the outcomes of the analysis Lists of equipment needs generated for each interested and selected laboratory, based on preferences form the laboratories, their existing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Overview of laboratories in Lebanon and their testing capabilities Listing of equipment needs to fill gaps (currently existing and potential gaps in the near future) in testing and/or calibration activities 	100%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		equipment and their capabilities			
INS B2	Developing inventory of existing structures (in conjunction with A2) and identify the role and responsibilities of Ministries in the CA field				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A comprehensive database of existing laboratory structure and capabilities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Database compiled on the basis of information collection form INS B1 For roles and responsibilities of ministries in conformity assessment; See POL B1. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Database of laboratories <p>Constraints:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintaining a database on laboratory testing capabilities, as an information source for private and public sector use, required efforts and inputs that were not foreseen in the Quality Programme. 	100%	
INS B3	Preparing testing and calibration laboratory investment guide				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A detailed list of Lebanese laboratory testing capabilities to be available on the website 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Database was available through a link to the website of MoET 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The database was not incorporated in the new QUALEB website, due to become out of date (See remark in INS B2) 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A listing of Lebanese laboratories could be a useful instrument for enterprises and non-profit organisations in locating certain testing capabilities within the country. However, maintaining such a list is a rather demanding task that needs to be performed regularly. Such updates have not been foreseen in any of the follow-up programmes of the Quality Programme. Nevertheless, COLIBAC once it has become an operational institution should maintain a list of accredited laboratories and details of the tests for which they have been accredited.
INS B4	Developing laboratory networks (on the basis of the national metrology plan) and train potential applicants				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An inter laboratory working group established Training and upgrading the different laboratory participants to the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inter-laboratory working group established and 6 meetings held for discussions on gap analysis and instrument needs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Laboratories are aware of each other's field of expertise, have a common understanding about difficulties on implementing ISO 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The experience-exchange group worked very well among the laboratories and would be well worth preserving. One of the possible ways

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	network	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience-exchange group formed and 7 meetings held for discussions on the implementation of ISO 17025 (See INS B8) • Training on proficiency testing held. 	17025 and accreditation process		in which that could be achieved, is in the framework of a quality association. In the Sustaining Quality project an effort will be made to create a quality association.
INS B5	Managing application procedures, selecting recipients on a competitive basis and signing contracts				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A list of selected laboratories suggested by the expert committee • Framework contracts signed with the participating laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Selection of laboratories performed on the basis of predetermined criteria and substantiated by results of questionnaires, expert visits and reports, discussions in inter-laboratory working group and the laboratories own applications. • Contracts drafted for cooperation in the programme, the supply of equipment and the provision of consultancy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11 testing laboratories selected • Contracts signed with all of them 	100%	
INS B6	Preparing detailed specifications of equipment for laboratories				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed specification of laboratory equipment, completed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed technical specifications written by ISTE's and LSTE's for 575 pieces of laboratory equipment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The specifications have been used as inputs for the equipment tenders 	100%	
INS B7	Tendering equipment (including ongoing support to recipients)				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tenders for equipment launched • Maintenance and upgrading plan for equipment, completed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 tender dossiers prepared for the purchase of testing calibration equipment prepared • Tenders launched and implemented according to procedural requirements • Evaluation of bids made • Contracts signed with winning suppliers • Contracts with laboratories signed on support for equipment, training and consultancy. • ISTE's and LSTE's supervised deliveries, installation, commissioning 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Equipment contracted and delivered <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not all planned equipment could be contracted. One lot of the large equipment supply tender failed, because none of the offers was compliant with the specifications. The complete tenders for additional equipment failed due to circumstances related to the war of July/August 2006. No equipment for calibration of water flow meters, 	100%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<p>and training according to supply contracts. Provisional acceptance signed for all supply contracts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supervising site preparations by laboratories according to MoET contract with laboratories • Inventory of training needs made and training modules designed related to new testing methods for laboratories. 	<p>calibrations of hardness, and some other testing equipment (among which 2 LC/MS)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some laboratories were not ready with preparations of facilities at the moment of arrival of equipment, which gave rise to delays • In a limited number of cases some auxiliary equipment to make systems operational and/or calibration certificates were missing due insufficiently clear specifications, giving rise to delays in operability. 		
INS B8	Providing laboratory management training				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One or more staff from each selected laboratory participated in a quality assurance course (see INS A8) • Report of the status of laboratories in the process of having a quality assurance system in place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Master plan for assistance to laboratories on how to achieve accreditation drafted, as well as detailed road maps for individual laboratories. • 15 laboratories have received multiple visits from ISTE and LSTE for advice and support on the implementation of a quality management system and in preparation for accreditation with a total of 766 consultancy days • 23 training courses on ISO 17025 related subjects: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 1 introductory course ○ 3 basic training courses on ISO 17025 ○ 4 advanced training courses on ISO 17025 ○ 3 training courses on internal audit for ISO 17025 ○ 2 training courses for laboratory managers on the principles and benefits of ISO 17025 ○ 2 training courses on how to manage change ○ 1 training course on method validation ○ 1 training course on uncertainty 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15 laboratories are applying laboratory quality management systems in accordance with the requirements of ISO 17025 • 2 laboratories have achieved an internationally recognised accreditation • 6 laboratories are advancing in the process of accreditation, leading to more accreditations in the coming year. • Laboratory staff has been trained on the proper use of the new equipment and test that can be performed with this equipment, therefore increasing the testing capacities within the country • 440 persons have participated in the training activities, increasing the level of knowledge on the application of quality management in the laboratory sector. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability of the effort depends on the laboratories being able to maintain their accreditations. One of the requirements for continuation of the accreditation is participation by the laboratories in proficiency tests (for testing laboratories) and inter-laboratory comparisons (for calibration laboratories), either at the national or international level. Within the Sustaining Quality Project a national coordination capacity will be set up to do proficiency testing among Lebanese laboratories. • See also the remarks in INS C8

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		budgeting for calibration laboratories ○ 3 training courses on uncertainty budgeting for testing laboratories ○ 38 days of in-house training for basic testing methods (e.g. food microbiological testing, mass spectrometry, gas chromatography, liquid chromatography, petroleum characterisation, thin layer chromatography, pesticide residue chemistry, calibration of radiation protection detectors, calibrations for photometry, training on equipment procurement) ○ 12 days of in-house training for advanced method specific training (e.g. GMO testing, metal residue analysis) ○ 7 meetings of the experience exchange group for ISO 17025 organisations			
INS B9	Providing training and assistance to develop laboratory quality systems				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One or more staff from each selected laboratory participated in a quality assurance course (see INS A8) Report of the status of laboratories in the process of having a quality assurance system in place Four or more laboratories are in the process of having certified / accredited quality assurance systems in place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8 There is only a gradual difference between the activities planned for INS B8 and INS B9. However, they are strongly interlinked and therefore during implementation no distinction was made, and the whole package treated as one. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS B8
INS B10	Preparing accreditation process, test run accreditation cycles and achieve full accreditation for minimum of two laboratories				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports on the status of laboratories in the process of becoming accredited 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS C8 on following up the status of laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS C8 on following up the status of laboratories 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See remarks INS C8

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two laboratories accredited by European accreditation body 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As for final results in terms of accreditation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 laboratories accredited (ACTS and IRI Engineering Lab) 6 laboratories are in the process of accreditation, meaning that they have a contract with an accreditation body, subsequently have been through pre-audit visits, subsequently have been audited and/or are working on correcting (minor) non-conformities A further 7 laboratories have implemented a laboratory quality management system (ISO 17025) as first step towards accreditation 		
INS C	FULL FUNCTIONING AND OPERATIONAL ACCREDITATION SCHEME				
INS C1	Support identifying the key partners and obtaining initial agreement for the Lebanese Accreditation Scheme				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of accreditation bodies including possible international organisations of accreditation bodies A framework agreement approved by the network of accreditation bodies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not relevant any longer after the decision of the EC not to use the twinning instrument, but service contracts instead 	0%	
INS C2	Support and setting up an accreditation body and local network				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Accreditation body established Co-operation agreement with 1 or more European accreditation bodies initiated 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Started with preparatory activities on organisation structure, drafting bylaws and internal procedures and training programme for external assessors and lead assessors, by international experts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A plan for the operational setup of COLIBAC is prepared. A large set of documents have been prepared relating to different subjects in organisation and operations of an accreditation body <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> COLIBAC is still not an operational organisation, due to; 	40%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continue with building the operational and management framework for COLIBAC by finalising the necessary documentation during the 'Sustaining Quality' project. As soon as COLIBAC has a budget and staff, start with the implementation of the prepared programme in 2009. Also start with the practical training of the assessors

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No director-general yet appointed and therefore also no other staff for the operational activities of COLIBAC hired. There is no budget available for 2007 and 2008 Due to the lack of a minister or acting minister at the Ministry of Industry for 2 years no decisions were taken. 		in performing accreditation audits
INS C3	Planning training/twinning package involving one or several European accreditation bodies				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agreement on twinning in place with agreed EU partners 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activity on twinning due to the fact that no twinning instrument was to be used Instead technical specifications were developed for technical assistance to COLIBAC, as part of a large service contract for training and consultancy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete set of technical specifications for training and consultancy 	100%	
INS C4	Tendering the training/twinning package				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training/twinning in place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tender dossier for the purchase of training and consultancy services prepared. Evaluation of bids made Contract signed with winning contractor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Service contract for the delivery of training and consultancy services signed with a consortium, led by Gruppo Soges. 	100%	
INS C5	Providing initial training of accreditation body staff and assessors				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fully trained staff and assessors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 training courses on general introduction to accreditation process 1 training course for potential assessors in the field of Certification Bodies certifying products 1 training course for potential assessors in the field of Certification Bodies certifying persons 1 training course for potential assessors in the field of Certification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A group of about 30 person trained as potential assessors in the different fields of accreditation 11 persons out of the 30 trained as potential lead assessors <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessors are still missing the required participation (on the job training) in at least two audit visits 	66%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As soon as the issue of an operational budget for COLIBAC is solved, the director-general has been appointed and core staff has been hired, COLIBAC can directly become an operational organisation. It will need some guidance by some international experts in order to bring it quickly through its start up phase. Just normal functioning is the prime

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<p>Bodies certifying management systems</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 training course for potential assessors in the field of testing and calibration laboratories • 1 training course for potential assessors in the field of Inspection Bodies • 1 training course for potential lead assessors 	<p>done by another accreditation body in order to become full assessors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Also the core staff of COLIBAC has not been trained due to the fact that COLIBAC is still not an operational body 		<p>target in the first place, because COLIBAC can then start serving the local organisations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Once it starts functioning as an accreditation body in line with international requirements the memberships of international organisations will follow and then the participation in the Multilateral Recognition Agreements
INS C6	Supporting development of Lebanese inspection and certification bodies				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of potential certification and inspection bodies established • Support given to potential Lebanese certification and inspection bodies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No activities 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although COLIBAC was officially in existence, it was and is still not operational. National accreditation of inspection and certification bodies could not have been achieved. In view of the many other activities to be implemented, this activity was postponed. 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The planned activity has been carried forward to the Sustaining Quality project and should be finished with accreditations of a number of inspection and certification bodies during the second phase of the Quality Programme
INS C7	Supporting Lebanese companies and organisations to become certified				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support is given to interested companies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 51 companies have received multiple visits from ISTE and LSTE for advice and support on the implementation of a quality management system with a total of 1187 consultancy days • 34 training courses on ISO 9001 related subjects: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 8 basic training courses on ISO 9001 ○ 5 training courses on strategic management ("Think Strategically") ○ 7 advanced training courses on ISO 9001 ○ 3 training courses on human resource management as aspect of quality management ○ 4 training courses on internal audit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 51 organisations have received consultancy on implementation of quality management systems: 21 for ISO 9001 and 30 for ISO 22000 • 38 organisations have achieved certification for their quality management system: 19 for ISO 9001 and 19 for ISO 22000 • Almost 1000 participants in training courses, who gave an average score of 3.5 (on a 4 point scale) to the quality and usefulness of the training courses. • The knowledge level on quality management has significantly been increased 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The interest and the momentum for the subject of quality management, created in the Quality Programme, among primarily the business sectors should be maintained. Not through more training on basic quality management system requirements, but through other activities. One of them would be to try to revive the idea of experience exchange groups, possibly within a setting of a Lebanese Quality Association. Another one would be to strive for higher levels of management excellence through the introduction of innovative management models and through the introduction of a prestigious Lebanese national quality

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> for ISO 9001 ○ 3 training courses on how to manage change ○ 3 Train the Trainer courses in order to develop in-house training capabilities in organisations ○ 15 days of in-house training for owners and managers on quality management in the different organisations ○ 1 meeting of the experience exchange groups for ISO 9001 organisations ● 23 training courses on ISO 22000 related subjects: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 8 basic training courses on ISO 22000 ○ 7 advanced training courses on ISO 22000 ○ 3 training courses on internal audit for ISO 22000 ○ 3 training courses on how to locate critical control points ○ 1 training course on basic hygiene for workers in the food industry and 15 days of in-house training in the different companies ○ 13 days of in-house training on hygiene for supervisors and inspectors in the food industry ○ 1 meeting of the experience exchange group for ISO 22000 ○ Additional Awareness training modules delivered in co-operation with the CCIA and ALI in four geographic locations ○ ISO 9001 Basic & Advanced training (8 modules) ○ ISO 22000 Basic & Advanced training (8 modules) ○ In addition, ISO 22000 Basic & Advanced training modules delivered for ADP client organisations (2 modules) 			<p>award. Within the Sustaining Quality project and also for the second phase of the Quality Programme such ideas will be pursued.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The idea of process management and process improvement through the introduction of quality management systems should also be extended to the public sector. A public sector that is able to implement legislation and regulations in an efficient way and can at the same time respond to the needs of its clients (among others, the business community), will be a positive factor for economic and social development.
INS C8	Supporting implementation of				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	training/twinning package				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodically reports on the status of the ongoing twinning/training activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Systematic approach developed for review of progress in laboratories through monthly reporting, continuous assessment of progress and audits of the QM systems 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All participating laboratories have received evaluations of their performance and advice on how to proceed with the preparatory activities for accreditation. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It was the intention to use the laboratories, receiving consultancy for the introduction of quality management, as training objects for the assessors of COLIBAC. That would have been to the benefit of all organisations. COLIBAC assessors would be trained on the job in the assessment process. Laboratories would receive valuable feedback on their progress towards quality system implementation. Due to the fact that COLIBAC did yet not become an operational organisation, the progress reviews could not be done by prospective technical assessors and lead assessors, as part of their on-the-job training. Therefore resources in the project had to be used, in particular the key-experts (who are all also lead assessors for laboratory accreditation). Some laboratories have developed their quality management system at a different level than initially planned, due to problems related to equipment (a more limited scope of accreditation). 	60%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Accreditation of laboratories remains one of the incentives for support to international trade and to quality improvement. Having laboratories that can work according to recognised international methods in country makes it easier for businesses to enter international markets. Test results of the local laboratories will be recognized in other countries as valid results. Using local laboratories is often more economical. In the Sustaining Quality project attention is paid to setting up a system of proficiency testing for laboratories. Participation in proficiency tests, which gives an indication about the quality of the methods applied by a laboratory, is a requirement for continued accreditation. Supporting additional qualified laboratories in preparing for accreditation is an activity foreseen for the Quality Programme Second Phase.
INS D	SUPPORT NATIONAL STANDARDS INSTITUTE TO REORGANISE AND TO IMPROVE ITS MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONAL CAPACITIES				
INS D1	Conducting an analysis of enterprise needs, for information				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	on national and international standards				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Survey of needs for information of standardisation in Lebanese industry 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Limited amount of information was collected in conjunction with the survey of economic sectors and laboratories 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Knowledge about industrial sectors and companies that use and have access to standards in differing degrees 	100%	
INS D2	Preparing training and institutional twinning package				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Twinning/training package prepared 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activity on twinning due to the fact that no twinning instrument was to be used Instead technical specifications were developed for technical assistance to LIBNOR, in particular the development of database applications, as part of a large service contract for training and consultancy. Decision was made to support the reorganisation of LIBNOR and the training of staff not from the service contract for training and consultancy, but from the contract for technical assistance to the Quality Programme, because the presence of a national standardisation body (NEN) in the Tecnitas consortium. Moreover, this technical assistance could start much earlier during the programme. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Set of technical specifications for development of database applications 	100%	
INS D3	Tender training/twinning package				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Twinning/training with European standardisation body tendered Twinning/training with European standardisation body in place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tender dossier for the purchase of training and consultancy services prepared. Evaluation of bids made Contract signed with winning contractor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Service contract for the delivery of training and consultancy services signed with a consortium, led by Gruppo Soges. 	100%	
INS D4	Providing initial assistance to set up the Enquiry Point				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A well functioning LIBNOR Enquiry Point, in operation User friendly availability of Lebanese 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<p><u>Constraint:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work on the WTO National Enquiry Point was postponed at the request 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The WTO/NEP is an activity in the Sustaining Quality project. LIBNOR received some training on the subject

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	and international standards, to the private sector		of LIBNOR. The work load from the reorganisation process and the lack of new staff, prevented LIBNOR from participating in setting up a WTO/NEP <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lebanon is still not a member of the WTO and is therefore not under the obligation to establish a National Enquiry Point 		through USAID. Sustaining Quality will elaborate on that effort, while some further assistance is proposed for the second phase of the Quality Programme. There is no urge to complete it at short notice, but it is definitively a preparatory activity for the upcoming membership of the WTO.
INS D5	Supporting implementation of the training/twinning package				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Updating and training of LIBNOR staff Regular updating of the 'Enquiry Point' database 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For support to the implementation of the development of database application it was deemed necessary to upgrade the IT infrastructure of LIBNOR. For that purpose the following activities were performed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analysis of IT needs made Equipment specifications drafted Tender dossier prepared for IT equipment tender For support to the reorganisation of LINOR: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New law on standardisation drafted and endorsed by Board of LIBNOR 21 missions from international standardisation experts to assist LIBNOR with reorganisation 9 missions from two international experts for advice on IT infrastructure and development of database applications Local consultants working on the development and technical realisation of database applications Seminar on new Technical Committee structure held Applications for ISO and CEN membership filed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New IT infrastructure not realised. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The IT tender failed due to the war situation, as no local companies were willing or able to prepare bids under these extreme circumstances. As an alternative only a server was purchased from the budget for small purchases (under € 5.000). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Full membership of ISO achieved per July 2006 and CEN partner membership in June 2008. New Technical Committee structure introduced mirroring ISO structure with first TC's operating according to new procedures New organisational structure embedded in draft law LIBNOR endorses the WTO/TBT Code of Good Practice for Standardisation New workflow processes are introduced in compliance with the requirements of ISO and CEN LIBNOR turned around from a top-down driven, national oriented organisation to a pro-active, international oriented standards organisation. IT infrastructure is partially improved 3 new database applications 	75%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although LIBNOR has made great progress, some level of support will still be needed to complete the reorganisation process and add some new functionality to LIBNOR. More TC's, mirroring activities in ISO, CEN and Codex Alimentarius, need to become functional and the operation of the secretariat function of LIBNOR to TC's needs to be more ingrained into the organisation. The membership basis of LIBNOR needs to be increased (both in terms of types of companies and in terms of regional spread). Membership of IEC and CENELEC needs still to be attained and their respective procedures incorporated. Also the new law on standardisation needs to be incorporated into the organisational structure. As much of the work in international standardisation is based on the exchange of large quantities of documents through internet, the IT function of LIBNOR needs to be strengthened (both equipment and know-how) and professionalised. LIBNOR needs to develop a (minimal) presence at the international level through participation in meetings of international TC's and organizations.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			<p>(standards Meta data, national standards catalogue and work flow) and new website developed, delivered and operational.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff trained in the use of databases • Members of TC's can download their information and documents now through the website and upload their comments and cast their votes. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Membership issue of IEC (and therefore also CENELEC) not yet solved with the Order of Engineers • See POL D1 concerning legislation • New staff members for LIBNOR did not enter the organisation in 2007 		
ENT A	PROVATE SECTOR WILL BE MUCH MORE AWARE OF THE ROLE AND IMPORTANCE OF QUALITY AND CONSUMER PROTECTION ISSUES				
ENT A1	Agree target sectors, goals and enterprises				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A detailed sub-sector gap analysis completed, based on the ToR's prepared by an expert group • An list of sub-sectors to be targeted, approved by the expert group 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expert Group on Research and Analysis established and several meetings held • Initial market research carried out, priority target sectors selected and outcomes endorsed by WG. • Expert group made recommendation for analysis of additional sectors like packaging, printing and software development. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A total of six key target sectors have been identified as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Processed fruits & vegetables ◦ Wine & Arak industries ◦ Milk & milk related products ◦ Vegetable fats and oils (Tahina & Olive Oil) ◦ Cosmetics & perfumery ◦ Electrical and electronic products • These agreed sub-sectors have been targeted for all QUALEB awareness and training related activities <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The analysis of the additional sectors has not been carried out due to the fact that the EFTA-funded project "Market Access and Conformity for 	65%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			<p>Lebanese Exports" has the packaging industry as one of its main target groups, and also in view the fact that software companies have shown little enthusiasm for participating in the Quality Programme. Moreover, three companies from the printing sector participated in the ISO-certification project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Also the tender for Additional Training failed, of which this research and analysis activities on additional sectors were part. 		
ENT A2	Design, produce & print a quarterly QUALEB Newsletter				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Eleven QUALEB newsletters published in English / Arabic, reaching the target audience • The newsletter has successfully disseminated the Quality Programme objectives • Development and upgrading the content, reflecting reader feedback 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 9 issues of the Quality Info Newsletter prepared, edited and printed • Each newsletter printed in 10.000 copies, of which 9.000 distributed according to a mailing list and the remainder distributed at QUALEB events 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wide dissemination of quality issues and the Quality Programme as such achieved, including some positive feedback received from readers of 'Quality Info' Newsletter 	82%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dissemination of activities and results of the Quality Programme should continue within the next projects. Although editing newsletters is very time consuming activity
ENT A3	Develop a media communications strategy to target private sector companies				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality Programme activities have been widely covered in the print media and on TV (questionnaire indicator used) • Widespread recognition of the Quality Programme, in the private sector (questionnaire indicator used) • Much greater appreciation of the Quality issue, in the Lebanese mass consumer market ((questionnaire indicator used) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Media specialist appointed to support communications role resulted in additional print media coverage • Regular media coverage continues to raise the project profile • An assignment was given to an LSTE (related to a well-know media group) to develop a professional communications strategy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Heightened press coverage with 43 separate newspaper articles during 2007 • This print media coverage was covered in Arabic, French and English language Lebanese dailies and magazines. • QUALEB Award ceremony with participation of the Prime Minister was covered in the news bulletins of all TV stations <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The systematic measurement of the effects of the media exposures has not been done. • The media communications strategy 	75%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Quality Unit will have to make a continuous effort during her further existence to attract the attention of the media in order to convey its core message. • In the Sustaining Quality project an effort will be made to collect data on the knowledge about and appreciation of the Quality Programme.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
			presented was not up to standard and based on assumptions that were not realistic.		
ENT A4	Develop and plan a series of QUALEB related conferences, seminars & round table meetings, on specific topics of relevance plus related Trade Shows				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Annual International Quality conference is now a major regional event, securing significant international visitors to Lebanon The programme of seminars/round table meetings have become part of the programme of activities now organised by the National Quality Centre 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The following activities were organised by the Quality Programme: International Arab Food Safety and Quality Conference (Beirut, June 2006) co-organised with UNIDO; attended by 300 participants from 21 Arab and non-Arab countries Seminar on metrology in short Presentation for the launching of training programme on ISO 9001 and ISO 22000 for companies in co-operation with key stakeholders (CCIA / ALI) Metrology Day together with IRI Training seminars in cooperation with the regional Chambers of Commerce on ISO 9001 (3) and ISO 22000 (3) Seminars on food safety management systems(2) for participants in the ADP project Three day interactive workshop on 'Food Safety & Exporting food to the EU' Seminar for introduction of the new Technical Committee structure in LIBNOR Lebanese Food Safety Day, a joint seminar with MACLE (UNIDO), the Syndicate of Lebanese food industries and USAID. Seminar on Six Sigma approach to implementation of quality management. Seminar on Supply Chain Management. Awareness seminar for media on the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Large outreach to the core target groups of the Quality Programme Wide audience informed about topics of interest to the implementation of quality <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The failure of the Tender for Seminars and Conferences limited the number of activities, because the means for organising and facilitating such events was lacking. 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All follow up project should have ample means for organising seminars and conferences. It is one of the most important means of direct communication with the target groups and one that provides immediate feedback.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<p>Quality Programme</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Delivery of a series of awareness seminars to a small number of Universities (2), and Vocational Education Institutions (5) on the theme of 'Innovation and Care', in line with the European Quality Week 2007. • QUALEB Award Ceremony for ISO certified companies with participation of Minister and Prime Minister (December 2007) • QUALEB Award Ceremony for second group of ISO certified companies with participation of Minister. 			
ENT A5	Design, produce & print flyers to be inserted in media packs				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotional flyers have successfully supported the dissemination process (number of reply coupons received) • Quality Programme now well established, such that electronic promotional activities have replaced printed material (Website, CDs etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 brochures designed for the Quality Programme • Brochures disseminated at all QUALEB activities and are part of the QUALEB information package. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brochures are one of the means in the communication strategy of the Quality Programme <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Electronic promotional activities have not yet replaced printed material. That is mainly due to the fact that the internet in Lebanon is not that well developed (penetration level, usage, technology and speed of connection). It is also partly due to the fact that the new website with better technological features became available only during the second half of the programme. 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • During the follow up projects of the Quality Programme, a gradual shift in the ration of electronic communication to printed matter needs to be realised. • Electronic communication, if done in the proper way, will be faster and cheaper than the more traditional forms of communication, although printed material will remain needed for a long time.
ENT A6	Design promotional support materials for the project duration				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Three sided, full colour, illuminated backdrop (used extensively in all Quality Programme activities) • The Ministry of Economy & Trade has been established as a key information source, on quality issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Logo for QUALEB designed • Logo for QUALEB redesigned in 2006 • A complete suite of business stationary designed in line with the new logo • Backdrop and pop-up stands for QUALEB designed and delivered • Specifications developed for 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Especially with the new logo and the consequent application on all promotional items, promotional activities, website, publications, training, seminars, conference, etc. QUALEB has managed to create and disseminate a strong brand identity among its target groups. 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue using the QUALEB logo as the hallmark of quality promotion.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> promotional items in line with visibility requirements Tender dossier for visibility items prepared and tendered according to EC procedural requirements Evaluation of bids Contract signed with the selected supplier and promotional items delivered 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB (and indirectly the Ministry of Economy and Trade) has been established and recognised as the central organisation for the promotion of quality. Strong brand recognition for QUALEB enhancing the visibility of the Quality Programme among the Lebanese private sector. 		
ENT A7	Develop, publish and print a series of 'ABC Guide to' booklets				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A total of eleven or twelve 'ABC Guide' booklets have been published and distributed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 9 bi-lingual (English and Arabic) ABC Guides written, and edited (Quality, Food Safety Management Systems, Metrology, Packaging & Labelling, Accreditation, Certification, Standardisation, New Approach, Conformity Assessment) Depending on subject and estimated target group between 4.000 and 15.000 copies were printed and are distributed through a mailing list and at QUALEB events. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wide dissemination of information to mainly the business sector on some key topics of quality and quality infrastructure and on the relationship between quality and international trade. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The planned 11 to 12 ABC guides was a rather ambitious goal. Production of these guides is long process, in which especially the translation of a specific technical terminology posed a major constraint, but also the pre-printing process of type-setting and proof reading. These processes took much more time than foreseen. In one case the translation took more than 18 months to be completed. 	82%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The publication of ABC guides will be continued in the Sustaining Quality project with another 3 issues. No such activities are planned for the second phase of the Quality Programme. The essential steps in the process of conformity assessment have all been dealt with.
ENT A8	Design a series of promotional activities to disseminate QUALEB activities to the wider Lebanese business and mass consumer market				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality Slogan has achieved wide spread recognition in the Lebanese mass consumer market (consumer reaction to quality issues as indicator) Production of additional promotional merchandising items to support 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See ENT A4 / ENT A6 / 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is not much distinction between the activities planned for this activity and the activities as planned for ENT A4 in particular. 	--	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> dissemination and create awareness Large number of successful events and activities Questionnaire used to measure the effectiveness of the dissemination activities 				
ENT B	THE NEED FOR INFORMATION ON STANDARDS AND CONFORMITY ASSESSMENT PROCEDURES IS ASSESSED				
ENT B1	Implement a comprehensive market research assignment to establish target sector company information needs and analysis of R & D capacities				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed sub-sector information needs on International standards, Conformity Assessment procedures and export readiness identified Independent analysis and specific steps to be taken, identified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See ENT A1 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See ENT A1 	65%	
ENT B2	Design and create a website, which is interactive for the Lebanese private sector, which provides value-added information, with direct links to key stakeholders and possibly a search engine to link up with European Directives				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fully upgraded interactive user friendly QUALEB website, including sections on Work plans, on-line registration for training modules, seminar programme, round table meetings, Quality forum, Quality programme milestones to-date, FAQs, photo gallery etc. Fully upgraded direct links to European and other relevant international Directives Key success indicators defined, which reflect the private sector 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> First version of QUALEB website was integrated into the MoET website, difficult to access and with limited possibilities for updating Technical structure of an interactive website designed by web development company Graphic design adapted to the renewed QUALEB look and main content re-edited for greater simplicity and intelligibility. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New QUALEB website completed and functioning (www.qualalb.org). However, not all sections of the website are fully functional. 	90%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintaining the website and completing the content and continuously updating the sections (especially news and events) will have to be performed during the follow up programmes. Especially in the second phase of the Quality Programme the website needs to become the major source of information on quality related matters.

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	users needs				
ENT C	AN EFFECTIVE AWARENESS CAMPAIGN IS DEVELOPED, BASED ON THE OUTCOMES OF THE MARKET RESEARCH				
ENT C1	Establish a QUALEB presence at trade fairs and exhibitions				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Quality Unit will have participated in six Lebanese National trade fairs The capacity building of the Lebanese staff will be greatly enhanced in relation to all issues associated with trade fair participation and management The Quality programme will have used the opportunity to widely disseminate its programme of activities, on a sectoral basis The Quality Unit will have participated in and attended six international trade fairs / exhibitions Lebanese QUALEB staff will have had direct experience and exposure to international trade 'shop-windows', both in Europe and in the Gulf region Members of the Quality Advisory Committee will also have participated in International trade fairs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Participation at ANUGA Food Fair (Cologne, October 2005) with ALI / Syndicate of Lebanese Food Industries Participation at Gulf Food (Dubai, February 2006) with ALI / Syndicate of Lebanese Food Industries Participation in BEIRUT 2005 World Trade Fair (Beirut, September 2005) Participation in HORECA 2007 (Beirut, May 2007) Participation in HORECA 2008 (Beirut, May 2008) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Participation in 3 national trade fairs and 2 international trade fairs QUALEB staff gained direct experience in trade fair participation and management Some members of the Quality Advisory Committee participated in the international trade fairs (as representatives of their companies / syndicates) <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Failure of Tender for International Missions prohibited further participations in trade fairs and exhibitions abroad Failure of the tender for seminars made it more difficult to organise a meaningful participation and presence of QUALEB at the local trade fairs 	45%	
ENT C2	Design and specify a National Quality Day/Week				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Quality Week, supported by Lebanese and International European Institutions, fully established as an annual discussion event on quality International key-note speakers attending, to deliver the latest thinking on quality issues and directives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> International Arab Food Safety and Quality Conference (Beirut, June 2006) co-organised with UNIDO Delivery of a series of awareness seminars to a small number of Universities (2) and Vocational Education Institutions (4) on the theme of 'Innovation and Care', in line with the European Quality Week 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only 2 activities were achieved and a National Quality Week has not yet been established. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although the International Arab Food Safety and Quality conference was a major success, it could not be repeated and become the basis for a 	35%	

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Lebanese National Quality Week is established as an international regional quality event Increased levels of interest demonstrated by the private sector Growing levels of interest and participation in the student Quality award scheme 	2007.	<p>yearly national activity. The co-organiser and some of the countries preferred to circulate this conference among the Arab countries.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The failure of the tender for seminars and conferences had the effect that the Quality Programme was cut off from its major tool for organising events. Therefore, other events had to be on a much more simple and low-cost basis. 		
ENT D	APPROPRIATE DELIVERY MECHANISMS FOR INFORMATION SERVICES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT OTHER EC CO-FINANCED ACTIVITIES ARE DEFINED AND DEVELOPED				
ENT D1	Identify 'Missionary companies/organisations' to work with QUALEB				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Additional Lebanese companies will have committed to the Quality Programme objectives and ISO quality certification The updating of the database for ISO certified Lebanese companies will continue over the period of the project A broader base of private sector enterprises will be committed to the quality concept, including private sector manufacturers and service providers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS C7 See ENT F1 38 ISO certified organisations achieved by QUALEB can be considered as "missionary organisations" During the ISO certification project data were collected on all ISO certified organisations in Lebanon The success of the Quality Programme has led to additional requests from companies, syndicates and governmental organisations to be part of the programme 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> QUALEB is well established and recognised as the central organisation for the promotion of quality Companies and other organisations are willing to cooperate with QUALEB in promotional activities 	100%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The database of ISO certified companies has been completed during the Sustaining Quality project. As QUALEB will no longer be allowed in the follow up project to provide training and consultancy in the field of (simpler) quality management systems, it will have to look to other ways to keep the momentum. One such way will be the development and promoting of the national quality award. Another way will be the promotion of more complex forms of quality management, especially business excellence.
ENT D2	Discussions and co-ordination with relevant NGOs				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality related issues will be part of the targeted programme of activities for relevant NGOs Full co-operation and co-ordination with relevant NGOs has been 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Meetings with the NGO's and - in the same line - other donor organisations and projects were many during the lifespan of the Quality Programme. Most of them were of an informal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Results of this type of co-ordination activities include: International Arab Food Safety and Quality Conference (Beirut, June 2006) co-organised with UNIDO 	80%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This type of coordination activities are useful for the Quality Programme and should be extended into the follow-up projects. It is important that the QUALEWB has the budgetary

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<p>achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The members and target audience of relevant NGOs are fully committed to the objectives of the Quality Programme A number of joint meetings/events on the topic of quality, will have taken place 	<p>character for the exchange of information and opinions. Sometimes it was also about organisation of joint events.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organisations were among others: Chambers of Commerce, Joint Arab Chambers of Commerce, Association of Lebanese Industrialist, Syndicates (e.g. Food Industry, Restaurants, Banks, Travel Agents, etc.), Consumers Lebanon, UNIDO, USAID, Market Surveillance Twinning Project, ELCIM, ADP, SME project, MACLE project, Meat and Dairy Industries project and many others. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 ISO 22000 training modules at Zahle for ADP clients Participation at ANUGA Food Fair (Cologne, October 2005) with ALI / Syndicate of Lebanese Food Industries Participation at Gulf Food (Dubai, February 2006) with ALI / Syndicate of Lebanese Food Industries Participation in BEIRUT 2005 World Trade Fair (Beirut, September 2005) Participation in HORECA 2007 (Beirut, May 2007) Participation in ELCIM awareness seminars in Beirut (2), Zahle, Tripoli & Saida. Participation with ELCIM at the ALI training modules in Sanitation, GMP, HACCP & Labelling (January, February 2007) Participation with ECD in European Neighbourhood Days (November 2007) Lebanese Food Safety Day during HORECA 2008 together with Syndicate of Food Industries, USAID and MACLE project. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Failure of Tender for Seminars made it more difficult for QUALEB to cooperate in activities, because the Quality Programme was no longer able to offer facilities after September 2006. 		<p>possibilities to offer facilitation of such activities and/or experts as lecturers and moderators. It works best as parties have something to offer to each other.</p>
ENT D3	Establish a QUALEB Information Centre, focusing on Conformity Assessment as a core issue, including identification and dissemination of European benchmarks and indicators				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Source and procure the necessary IT equipment for the technical support information centre 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ISTE made technical feasibility study and defined needs for IT equipment. Specifications of required IT 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Through the completion of the technical feasibility study, it became apparent that the technical 	30%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the 'Sustaining Quality' project some attention will be given to the analysis of the real needs in this

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A technical support QUALEB Information Centre, focusing on Conformity Assessment, is established Intense levels of co-operation with other related information Centres in place 	<p>equipment prepared as inputs for IT equipment tender.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tender dossier for IT equipment (for several institutions) prepared and tender launched. 	<p>realisation of the idea is more complicated than initially assumed. It needs further clarification, especially on alternative approaches to data gathering and alternative organisational solutions.</p> <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The IT tender failed due to the war situation, as no local companies were willing or able to prepare bids under these extreme circumstances. <p>Failure of the IT equipment tender did make the technical realisation of the Information Centre impossible.</p>		<p>regard, while also alternative solutions will have to be looked into, such as combining the technical information centre with the Trade Information Centre at MoET, the Euro Information Centre at the Federation of Chambers of Commerce, or the future Export Promotion Board, or buying in into a foreign system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> If a Technical Information Centre is a technically and economically viable option, it is intended to make the supply of the technical infrastructure possibly a part of the second phase of the Quality Programme.
ENT E	A KNOWLEDGE BASE FOR TECHNOLOGICAL IMPROVEMENTS AND INNOVATIONS AMONG LEBANESE ENTERPRISES AND UNIVERSITIES, IS DEVELOPED AND PROMOTED				
ENT E1	Create a 'Quality company of the Season' award, leading to 'Company of the Year' award				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Lebanese Quality Award for companies / people, has been established as a critical and sought after professional award Lebanese Quality Company/person award scheme receives international recognition, offering the winner invitations to participate in other quality related international competitions The success of the award has greatly assisted in supporting the status and importance of quality as an issue (as indicated by changes to education curricula 	No activities	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deadlock on the establishment of the LNQC made promotion of national quality award an impracticality, as this activity was intended as one of the core activities of this organisation. 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality awards are an important mean to promote the use of business excellence models and consequently improving the capacities of enterprises and bring them to higher levels of quality management. The development of a national quality award is part of the Sustaining Quality project, while the further implementation and extension are planned for the second phase of the Quality Programme.
ENT E2	Develop strong links with university institutions				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key Lebanese universities provide a stronger focus on the quality issue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inventory of quality related courses provided at universities and technical 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Failure of the tender for additional 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continued attention to the importance of the educational sector

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The concept of Quality has become a significant part of the business management and technology syllabi Teacher training modules in quality related issues, become part of teacher upgrading skills Quality related publications are fully developed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> schools Report on relations between Quality, Innovation and Education Delivery of a series of awareness seminars to a small number of Universities (2) and Vocational Education Institutions (5) on the theme of 'Innovation and Care', in line with the European Quality Week 2007. 	<p>training in which the relationship of quality with education and the development of quality related courses was a core activity, stopped further progress on these activities</p>		<p>will be given in the Sustaining Quality project and will also be an activity within the second phase of the Quality Programme.</p>
ENT E3	Develop strong linkages with the Vocational education providers in Lebanon, including a possible booklet				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vocational educational intuitions provide a stronger focus on the quality issue The concept of Quality has become a significant part of the syllabi for Vocational educational institutions Teacher training modules in quality related issues, become part of teacher upgrading skills Quality related publications are fully developed for the sector 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS E2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS E2 	50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See INS E2
ENT E4	Establish an annual Student Quality Award, in relation to a quality thesis/project related issue				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> University student quality award achieves regional / international status Vocational student quality award achieves regional / international status The student award develops and grows in importance in both the university and vocational sectors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities performed 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activities like this one need to be embedded in a broader approach to quality awards. A student award should ideally be related to a national quality award. With the failure to setup the LNQC, the national framework for developing a quality award was for the time being not realised. 	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A student award on quality is one of the ideas presented for inclusion in the second phase of the Quality Programme. This activity should be embedded in the national quality award that is being developed in the Sustaining Quality project.
ENT F	PRACTICAL LINKS BETWEEN COMPANY NEEDS AND THE SUPPLY OF RELEVANT				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	TECHNOLOGICAL EXPERTISE, ARE ESTABLISHED				
ENT F1	Increase the quality knowledge of the enterprises				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quality knowledge and application in the private sector has increased, arising from the overall training programme (questionnaire as indicator) Quality management systems have been developed and expanded in private sector enterprises Quality knowledge and application in third level institutions (university / vocational) has increased, arising from the overall training programme (questionnaire as indicator) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For application of quality management systems in private sector enterprises; See INS C7 For the relationship with the educational sector; See ENT E2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The formulation of this activity is indistinguishable from a summary of all the activities done during the Quality Programme for the private sector. All other activities have had and still have an impact on it through such activities as general awareness (publications), seminars, training and consultancy for ISO-certification, etc. 	100%	
ENT F2	Analyse the R & D capacity of companies in agreed target sectors				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An assessment of the R&D capacities of private sector enterprises Recommendations on what steps need to be addressed, in response to any short comings identified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study completed on support schemes for quality in EU countries Study completed on R&D support programmes in EU countries Report on relations between Quality, Innovation and Education 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although there is a strong and positive relationship between the systematic application of the principles of quality management and higher levels of innovation in products and processes, R&D as such is not a primary concern of the Quality Programme. The lack of R&D facilities and/or stimulus programmes can, however, work as an inhibitor for quality improvements in organisations. As such it can become an aspect of a national quality policy. Therefore, a full assessment of the R&D capacities in the private sector was not made 	40%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The relationships between quality concepts of continuous improvement, innovation in products and processes and technological know-how and the introduction of advanced business excellence models will be of special importance for the planned second phase of the Quality Programme.
ENT G	LEBANESE NATIONAL QUALITY CENTRE IS ESTABLISHED WITH BROAD OUTREACH ACROSS THE PRIVATE SECTOR, TO DEVELOP				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	AND DISSEMINATE BEST PRACTICE, QUALITY ADVICE, TRAINING AND BENCHMARKING, ACROSS ALL SECTORS OF INDUSTRY.				
ENT G1	Clearly define the steps to be taken, including a time frame, for the establishment of the 'Lebanese National Quality Centre'				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concept of a Lebanese National Quality Centre is established, endorsed by Lebanese Government • Quality Unit staff can demonstrate substantial capacity building, in the development of the new institution • Board members agreed by stakeholders and appointed • Detailed business operational plan completed and in operation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • International and local experts implemented an assessment of needs • Expert group, formed with prospective board members and key stakeholders, discussed and agreed on recommendations for LNQC mission and organisation. • 4 missions undertaken by international expert to detail strategic plan and working plans for LNQC • 7 board members nominated and appointed by key stakeholders in November 2006. However, they only met on an informal basis. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed strategic plan and business plan prepared and agreed and funding needs identified • Physical location offered by the Federation of Chambers of Commerce & Industry • Parameters for an operational system of national quality awards identified, including a setup for a body taking responsibility for and organising such activities. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No formal meeting of Board of directors has taken place to make decisions on major strategic issues, although all members of the Board have been appointed by relevant organisations since November 2006. • The host organisation has neither the manpower, nor the funding available, contrary to previous commitments. Also other stakeholders did not make any commitments for funding of the LNQC. • Deadlock between the two principal stakeholders (CCIA and ALI) on the issue of chairmanship of the Board is blocking all activities. • Failure of the tender for IT equipment made it not possible to supply the LNQC with an office IT infrastructure. 	25%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In spite of broad based agreement on the need for an LNQC type body, its establishment has now been formally ended • It is planned that during the Sustaining Quality project a start is made with the development of a system for national quality awards. The first national quality awards will be given in 2009. IN the second phase of the Quality Programme the concept of a national quality award needs to be further developed. • The idea for developing an alternative organisation dealing with quality issues from a private sector perspective (National Quality Centre) will also be pursued.
ENT G2	Create a Quality Club / Forum targeting the private sector				

CODE	PLANNED RESULTS	ACTIVITIES PERFORMED	ACHIEVEMENTS/OUTPUTS	STATUS	SUSTAINABILITY
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Quality Club/ Forum has evolved into an formal institution The Quality Club/ Forum is actively promoting the concept of quality to the private sector The first steps have been taken, moving the Quality Club/Forum group into the Lebanese Quality institute 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One XX-group meeting for the ISO 9001 Certification project was held with most of the companies participating. One XX-group meeting for the ISO 22000 Certification project was held, again with most of the companies participating Seven XX-group meetings were held for ISO 17025 Laboratories. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A modest beginning has been made with a system of open discussions and exchange of information among organisations engaged in similar activities. The laboratory sector is more open to and enthusiastic for the idea, then the enterprises. <p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It was not possible to promote and plan the proposed XX Group meetings, until the ISO Certification project and the laboratory accreditation training began and a sufficient number of participants could be identified, engaged in the same type of activity. Companies were rather reluctant to participate in an open transparent manner, because they see the others participants still too much as competitors. 	15%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The concept of the XX Group meetings has very strong potential benefit for the participating companies and laboratories and it is intended to seek to further develop the concept of sharing experiences, with perhaps smaller and more focussed groups, during the extension of the contract for training and consultancy, the 'Sustaining Quality' project and the second phase of the Quality Programme. Eventually, the XX-group activities should become a part of the services of the national quality organisation.
ENT G3	Establish and disseminate European benchmarks and indicators				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All Quality related European benchmarks and indicators are being actively sourced and in use by the private sector The technical support QUALEB Information Centre, focusing on Conformity Assessment, is filling a supportive information gap for the private sector 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No activities were implemented for this activity during the life of the programme 	<p><u>Constraints:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It was assumed that the Information Centre would be the source of benchmarks and indicators. Not being able to setup the Technical Information Centre (due to the failure of the IT tender) also affected this activity 	0%	

3.4 Assumptions and Risks Status/Update

The Inception Report formulated a number of assumptions and a long list of risks.

The first group of assumptions contained four items:

- Accreditation structure in force
- Primary global enquiries on conformity assessment actors, partners, fields of activity, etc., have been completed
- Law on conformity assessment is in force
- Law on metrology is in force.

The first assumption, a functioning accreditation structure, was still not fulfilled at the end of the project. The primary problem is the appointment of the Director General of the organisation, which is, like any major government appointment in Lebanon, a political issue. Also no operational budget is allocated by the Ministry of Industry for COLIBAC. However, the expectation is that this problem will be solved somehow, if the appointment of the Director-General is effectuated. The hope is that COLIBAC will be able to hire staff, and probably will become operational towards the end of 2009.

The second one about the completion of preliminary enquiries was valid at the beginning of the project. This assumption was mainly related to finding a suitable twinning partner for COLIBAC. This assumption became out of date, when it was decided not to use the twinning instrument in the Quality Programme.

The third and the fourth assumption on laws for conformity assessment and metrology being in force, was also not a reality. At the beginning of the project, there was no law on conformity assessment, while the law on accreditation was not up to standard. Therefore, the existence of laws in these fields have turned from assumptions into a part of the output of the programme.

With regard to other assumptions, made in the Inception Report, the situation is not fundamentally altered. All that can be said is that QUALEB has been established as the primary focus for quality related issues and that the cooperation with the business community becomes better and better and more fruitful.

Assumption	Justification	Result	Update
The involvement and commitment of the private sector	The end beneficiary of the Quality Programme is the private sector	Will maximise the effects of the programme	Cooperation with representative organisations of the business community and individual companies is well developed.
Recognition and acceptance of the MoET role by consumers, quality support institutions and other stakeholders	The ultimate beneficiary of the Quality Programme is the Lebanese economy	This will enable access by the Project Team, to a range of partners and project associates in order to better implement the project parameters	QUALEB has become an established name and concept among the stakeholders. There is general recognition of the fact that QUALEB is the leading organisation for quality infrastructure development and quality promotion.
Empowerment and	The Quality Unit is	This will facilitate the	The functioning of the

leadership by the Head of the Quality Unit, with effective decision-making and general influence on third-party institutions	recognised and accepted as being key in implementing conformity assessment and quality systems	delivery of effective day-to-day monitoring and co-operation, by the Project Team	Quality Unit at MoET under its director has developed into a more positive factor for the project.
High motivation, availability and empowerment of the Lebanese counterpart staff at the Ministry of Economy and Trade	Previous results are evidence of this.	This will enable various monitoring and training tasks by the Contractor to be delivered in a timely and effective way	Lebanese counterpart staff have gained a good level of understanding of the major issues involved and are capable of responding to issues and challenges from experience and with knowledge.

The Inception Report listed many risks, which were somewhat condensed in the Progress Reports, while the format has been adapted.

One of the most important risk factors experienced during the implementation of the Quality Programme, is the partial collapse of the functioning of the political institutions in the country as a result of assassinations, bomb attacks, prolonged civil unrest and fighting insurgents. Also, the event of a war with serious damage to the country's infrastructure was not foreseen. It is clear that such events have serious and negative impacts on the project. However, the causes and remedies for such situations are beyond any risk management strategy that the project could handle.

Risks	Potential adverse effect	Risk Level	Risk management strategy	Responsibility
Necessary legislation does not come into force on time. State controlled institutions are not (fully) operational.	Implementation of parts of the project not effectuated Objectives and results will not be attained	H	Mobilisation of ministries, stakeholders, and European Delegation	Quality Programme MoET
Ministries are not ready and willing to establish an integrated and widely accepted national policy within the agreed timeframe. MoET not able to motivate, to lead, or to break the deadlock.	Implementation of policies and measures will become or remain fragmented. Lack of integration will lead to low level of effectiveness and efficiency.	H	The Project Team will provide systems and support to MoET with extra training and assistance. Seeking the direct involvement and support of the Minister from MoET and possibly the EC Delegation	Quality Programme
Absence of interest and/or real cooperation from primary and secondary stakeholders	Measures will bring only partly the planned effects and/or not in time.	L	Project Team will put extra effort in raising awareness. Focus and limit activities to the ready and willing.	Quality Programme
Low absorption capacity of recipients, (too few human resources; too low initial level of	Programme cannot be effectuated in the planned timeframe. Lower level of results achieved.	H	The Project Team will plan in close cooperation with the recipients the training programmes to	Quality Programme MoET

knowledge; long lead-times necessary for effective implementation)	Sustainability level may not be reached.		prevent a too high burden. MoET to consider request for extension of the Programme	
Political instability of the government	Decision making will go into low-gear, or will be postponed. Delays in implementation and delivery of results.	M	Mobilisation of EC Delegation for high profiled interventions.	EC Delegation

During the project all the mentioned risks did manifest themselves at some point in time.

It is clear that the political environment has become more volatile and precarious, especially during the second half of the programme. Government was focussing on solving and surviving the internal political crisis, which left very little room for and interest in decision making on technical issues, such as a quality infrastructure. Notwithstanding, the unyielding support of the Minister of Economy and Trade, it was rather difficult for the Quality Programme to secure high level cooperation among some other ministries.

In the list above there are three risks currently classified as high. Two have to do with the legislative process and the political culture, which require consensus building and compromise and consequently a substantial amount of time. Also within and among ministries there is no strong tradition of an integrated approach to solve problems and head off major challenges.

A well functioning quality infrastructure is in essence dependent upon a legal framework. The present legal framework of Lebanon is not yet adequate enough to ensure a quality infrastructure that resembles European best practice. Within the Quality Programme a coherent set of legislation has been prepared to lay the foundation for an approach to quality and quality infrastructure that can match the best systems in the world.

The political crisis since December 2006, in which Parliament has not been in session until May 2008, was not very conducive for a fast development on these issues. It has become a realistic assumption that major parts of the needed legislation will not be adopted, less come into force for some time to come. That time will definitively stretch even beyond the Sustaining Quality Project and into the planned second phase of the Quality Programme. Other than timely preparation of draft laws, there was very little that the Quality Programme could do to influence the legislative agenda. Given this political uncertainty, also in view of the upcoming elections in June 2009 and a possible change in government, and the almost complete impossibility to influence the political process, the qualification of this risk remains high.

The legal framework is one aspect of the matter; the other major aspect is people taking responsibility for their newly assigned tasks. No matter how well designed the legal framework is, if people in ministries are not willing to cooperate in the implementation of the necessary measures, the system will become dysfunctional. Introducing changes in systems and procedures requires a strong collaboration between stakeholders and the Ministry of Economy and Trade. At the working level,

the Quality Programme should involve all stakeholders in setting out the developments and jointly preparing implementing rules. The consequence of not effectively implementing the legal framework will be that the system will be wholly or in part ineffective. The most appropriate way to overcome this would be the direct involvement of stakeholders in preparation of legislation and in implementation. In other words, stakeholders in other ministries must have a feeling of ownership of the results through participation, information, discussion and training. This should be done both at the level of practical implementation of the rules, as well as on the management level.

The third high risk factor was related to the ambitions of the Quality Programme, which had to implement massive support in terms of training and consultancy for a rather limited and small group of recipients and in a limited timeframe. Despite a detailed planning, as much as possible based on the demand and the possibilities of the beneficiaries (laboratories and companies), full implementation of all activities foreseen was a very difficult and demanding task to accomplish. After several months of intensive training and consultancy efforts, it was clear that there was a real danger of overloading the beneficiaries. The extension of the implementation period gave some alleviation of the burden and made it possible that the objectives of the support to laboratories and companies could be met. Eventually, this risk was managed, and the training effort successfully completed.

3.5 Management and Coordination

The management responsibility for the Quality Programme rest with the Ministry of Economy and Trade, and more in particular with the Head of the Quality Unit for its day-to-day management. The staff of the Quality Unit consisted at the end of the project nominally of two experts for the Institutional Component, one for the Policy Component, one for the Enterprise Component, a Financial and Administrative expert, two administrative assistants, one driver and one office-boy/messenger. All ten functions were occupied in August 2008.

The position for the Enterprise Component has been formally vacant since April 2007, when the Enterprise component manager took over the position of Policy component manager. However, de facto she continued to work as interim manager for the Enterprise Component in view of the many training and consultancy activities going on there. That left, however, the Policy Component without much support. That situation was further aggravated by the fact that the Policy Component Adviser is also the team coordinator for the international advisors and experts, as well as the principal adviser to the Director of the Quality Unit, consequently spending most of his inputs on general and managerial activities. In December 2007 a contract was signed with a new staff member, who took over the tasks in the Enterprise Component from the Policy Component manager. From the beginning of 2008 the Quality Unit was at full strength.

The primary technical assistance to the Quality Unit was provided through the contract managed by Tecnicas. In spite of the political and security situation in the country, Tecnicas provided more than 2500 days of long-term experts, 1500 days of short term international expertise and about 600 days of local short-term experts. The Tecnicas team did see a number of changes in all but two positions. The adviser for the Enterprise component and the Senior Project Assistant completed the full period of the 38 months implementation period. The policy adviser resigned for reasons of health in April 2005 and subsequently replaced. The financial and administrative expert was replaced in 2007. The position of the adviser for the Institutional Development component was filled by four successive advisers. In all cases, finding replacements took time and each of the positions has been vacant for some period of time. For two functions (institutional development and finance and administration) the contractor provided experts from its backstopping services to secure continuity in the progress of the work.

The Quality Programme is supported by a Quality Advisory Committee, which is composed of high-level representatives of the most involved stakeholders and in particular the private sector. The QAC, which did meet seven times (on average every six months) to discussed and endorsed the more strategic issues of the development and implementation of the programme. For further support, input and discussions on specific issues a number of working groups were formed. These working groups were especially useful in the beginning of the project to gather information and opinions of target groups and stakeholders on particular problem areas. Working groups were in existence for:

- Metrology
- Testing laboratories
- Training, awareness and awards,
- Research and analysis

- National quality centre
- Quality policy
- Conformity assessment.

In most working groups one or more members of the Quality Advisory Committee were participating, maintaining therefore a close relationship between the different interests supporting the Quality Programme. The most active of all the working groups, was the one on metrology.

A characteristic of the organisation of the Quality Programme was the fact that MoET was at the same time Contracting Authority and the main beneficiary of the programme. Moreover, the staff of the Quality Unit of MoET and the team of international advisors were integrated into one unit and located in the same premises. This allows for very close and informal contacts, while at the same time compelling the advisors to accommodate to the daily decision making from the counterpart. It also created a high level of unity in approach and management and helped the efficiency and effectiveness of the programme's implementation, which was corroborated by the findings of the three monitoring missions, the external evaluation report, as well as the satisfactory outcome of the first auditing mission.

Another special aspect of the Quality Programme management was the fact that the Quality Unit and the international advisors were also directing the inputs of the key-experts and short-term experts supplied to the Quality Programme through the contract of Gruppo Soges for training and consultancy. They are assisted in this task by a team of three administrative assistants from Gruppo Soges.

The contract for providing the beneficiaries of the Quality Programme with a substantial amount of support through training and consultancy was initially designed to be implemented by a number of twinning contracts. These contracts would tie Lebanese quality infrastructure institutions directly to one of their European counterparts. However, it was decided by the EU (in July 2005) to replace the twinning contracts by one service contract. This contract had therefore a rather substantial size; GS has to deliver about 3000 days of expert inputs. In order to avoid a situation in which there would be a more or less independent project within the project, a customised setup was chosen. QUALEB decides when and where the inputs of experts are needed and GS has to make sure that the required expertise is available on time and in the quantity required. This model was chosen in order to make sure that the input of expertise is fully in line with the needs of the beneficiaries, the planning of QUALEB and the objectives of the Quality Programme.

It took some months for both parties to get used to working with this model. GS had some difficulty in adapting to this way of operating. Requests for experts were not always met on time and deadlines for the delivery of training materials were not always kept. As a consequence, some activities had to be postponed to later dates. For the Quality Programme it required more time and effort to be spent on planning and management.

3.6 Resources and budget used

A complete financial and administrative report was delivered in December 2007 and updated in September 2008. Therefore, there is no need to go into full details and only a summary of the most important data is provided, i.e. spending of the budget and expert inputs.

No.	Budget item	Budget	Committed	Balance	
1.0	Main technical assistance	€ 4.300.000	€ 4.182.493	€ 117.507	97.3%
2.0	Contracts with specialised Member State institutions	€ 3.000.000	€ 2.904.994	€ 95.006	96.8%
3.0	Supply contracts (equipment)	€ 6.000.000	€ 4.724.361	€ 1.275.639	78.7%
4.0	Other service contracts	€ 600.000	€ 140.539	€ 459.461	23.4%
5.0	Audits / evaluation	€ 400.000			
6.0	Contingencies	€ 700.000	€ 16.640	€ 683.360	2.4%
		€ 15.000.000	€ 11.969.027	€ 3.030.973	79.8%

Experts	Total Man-days budgeted	Man-days used at end of project	
Tecnitas contract (1)			
Long Term International Experts	2.660	2.631	98.9%
Short Term International Experts	1.583	1.564,5	98.8%
Short Term Local Experts	678	621	91.6%
Gruppo Soges (2)			
Key-experts	1732	1728	99.9%
Short-term experts	1422	1422	100%
Total	8.075	7.966.5	98.7%

Notes:

(1) Man-days budgeted as per addendum n° 2 of the contract

(2) Man-days budgeted as per addendum n° 2 of the contract and subsequent Administrative Order.

4 Key Quality/Sustainability issues

Building up or significantly developing a complete quality infrastructure for a country and introducing quality management systems as new business models in the private and public sectors is a long-term endeavour. It is a form of change management on a national scale. For Lebanon it implies a total change from one system of conformity assessment to another, as well as changing the mind sets of managers. The new system is based on the presence of a well-determined set of quality infrastructure institutions with precise roles and responsibilities. The basic responsibility for the safety of products is for the companies that manufacture and import products, while the quality infrastructure organisations have important supportive roles. The government has also a major role to play in this system. It has to provide the 'rules of the game' through a comprehensive and coherent set of framework legislation and specific technical regulations. It has to provide the guidelines for the operation of the system through formulating policies for different aspects of the quality system. It has also to safeguard the adherence to the system by the other players through a versatile system of market surveillance and through a general supervision.

Making the change from one system to the other takes time; actually it takes years. In the 46 months of the Quality Programme noticeable changes have been achieved in the field of standardisation (through the ongoing reorganisation of LIBNOR), conformity assessment (through upgrading of testing laboratories, both in the scope of their testing capabilities, as in international recognition through accreditation) and among the business sector (through introduction of quality management systems and raising awareness on quality issues in general). No effective changes were for example achieved in the field of accreditation (due to well-known problems around COLIBAC), legislation (only the framework laws prepared, but not adopted, let alone implemented) and inspection and certification (outside the scope of the Quality Programme). Minor progress was made in the field of metrology (a modest beginning with calibration activities) and in market surveillance (through some activities in the Quality Programme, but mostly through some other projects).

So the path and speed of developments in the fields of quality are not the same and not always in parallel. Moreover, changing systems is not just a matter of changing the rule book and the organisational setups. It is foremost, a matter of training people and changing their behaviour, so that they will be able and convinced to apply new ways of working. In other words, changes have to be internalised by people in the organisations and that surely does take its time. Furthermore, and especially in the area of quality infrastructure and quality management, the new approaches and working methods needs to achieve an internationally set level of competence in order to acclaim recognition by peer organisations elsewhere in the world. One of the final objectives of any quality infrastructure is to achieve an international level of mutual recognition, so that the level of safety of locally manufactured products is considered to be of equivalent value as that in other countries in the world. That is the ultimate enhancement of Lebanon's export capabilities and the basis for effective consumer protection. To reach such a level of competence requires even more time. Therefore, the sustainability of the achievements of the Quality Programme lays in long term continuation of the work. It requires building up a sufficient level of confidence and

competence in the different organisations, so that they will become self-sustaining (not just only financially, because that is not always possible in a small market as Lebanon) in their ambitions to reach world level in their field.

As a reminder and to make the analogy with the development of the quality infrastructure in the EU member states, the system as we know it there today, took twenty years of development. The EU started in the mid 1980's with the introduction of the New Approach to conformity assessment and the systems kept changing and fine-tuned. Even very recently, in 2008, the European Commission has published a review of the New Approach and adopted some essential changes in the system.

Such a major system change cannot be realised in a 46 months period and in a developing country with a lower level of economic and social development. Starting with a highly ambitious enterprise to achieve a complete change of system within the multi-faceted and complex field of quality infrastructure and quality management, needs a long term and clear commitment to the receiving country. It would be irresponsible to start with turning a system upside down and then leaving in the middle of the process. That would leave the country in a worse situation than it was before with old systems discarded and new systems not (sufficiently) functioning.

Fortunately the EU has recognised the long-term nature of building a quality infrastructure. Already the ECD had publicly expressed its intentions to provide continued support to the Quality Programme as part of its Indicative Plan 2008 – 2010 for Lebanon. On the other hand, this new assistance will not become available before the middle of 2009, for budgetary and procedural reasons. In order to avoid a break in the middle of the Quality Programme, the ECD made the decision to grant a smaller project to bridge the gap between the end of the technical assistance to the present Quality Programme (December 2007) and the start of the second phase of the Quality Programme (planned for July 2009). A budget of € 2.1 million has been made available for this purpose, financed from the Programme for Support to Reforms that is managed by the PAO at the Prime Minister's Office. This technical assistance contract has been granted directly to Tecnicas through a negotiated procedure, for which permission was received for the European Commission. Basically, it means that the Quality Unit will be further supported by the same team as before, securing the continuity of the Quality Programme and its approach.

In another aspect there was also continuity. It became apparent that, due to the delays incurred in the implementation of the Quality Programme, the contract for training and consultancy (Gruppo Soges) would not be completed within its original period to the end of December 2007. A substantial part of the available working days (about 40 percent, or up to 1200 days) would not be used and were at danger of being lost for the beneficiaries and for Lebanon's quality infrastructure. Discussions between the ECD and the Minister of Economy and Trade took place on this issue. The Minister of Economy and Trade sent a letter to the ECD requesting the extension of the implementation period of the Financing Agreement. On the 4th October, the ECD forwarded the decision to extend the implementation period with eight months. This meant that all contracts were followed through into 2008 and in particular that the working days of the Gruppo Soges contract were used to full advantage.

In the major table of this report many remarks have been made concerning the sustainability of individual activities. In this section also a number of general remarks have been made on the overall sustainability of the results of the Quality Programme. As a concluding paragraph some remarks will be made concerning the different aspects of quality infrastructure.

Legal Framework

The legal framework for the functioning of a quality infrastructure on comparable basis to the EU has been prepared. The critical step at the moment is the adoption of the proposed legislation by the government and by parliament. As long as that step is not taken, the actual implementation and the full completion of the system cannot be achieved. Once that hurdle is taken, the activities should concentrate on the implementation of the legislation by the different ministries and the different quality infrastructure organisations through building capacities and changing mind sets.

Testing laboratories

The Quality Programme has made a major contribution to the further development of testing capabilities in Lebanon and has put this activity clearly on a higher level of performance. The future of the quality this sector is primarily dependent on the laboratories themselves, in particular on achieving and maintaining accreditations, as international recognitions of their competence. A further impulse to the sector will be given by creating the ability to organise proficiency testing on a national scale. Increasing the critical mass of accredited laboratories and promotion of cooperation and exchange of experiences, will remain necessary.

Metrology

Metrology in Lebanon is a rather frail activity at the moment. Nevertheless, it is an essential function in support of industry, research and development and for legal purposes. Given the small scale of the country, there will be no need for extensive metrology services in every possible field of measurement. However, a certain basis for calibration of the most commonly used measuring devices needs to be present. Lebanon lacks a good legal framework for metrology and its development and implementation remain a necessary condition. Furthermore, the organisations responsible for the metrology functions need to be set up and start functioning. Parts of those functions have already been prepared on paper, but it is not completed yet.

Also the legal metrology function, which is at the present effectively only two persons, needs urgently to be reshaped and supported. It has to do with the introduction of technical regulations for control over certain types of measuring instruments and with training of metrology inspectors.

Certification and inspection bodies

This aspect of the quality infrastructure was not a part of the Quality Programme, but has been taken up in the Sustaining Quality project. There are a number of certification bodies active in Lebanon, but the majority of them are in the field of certification of management systems. In the other fields (inspection of products, certification of products, and certification of persons) there is hardly any activity, other than some foreign companies. The promotion of a limited number of

indigenous certification and inspection bodies will help to serve the needs of trade and industry and the work started in the Sustaining Quality project should be completed.

Accreditation

For the national accreditation system a large number of preparatory activities have been done in the Quality Programme. The organisation is completely prepared on paper and potential assessors have been trained. The major hurdle is the fact that the organisation is still not operational due to the fact that there is still no Director-General appointed and there is no budget for operational activities. Once these political problems are solved, it will be relatively easy to start up the organisation. It will all be about implementation of what has been prepared, coaching the organisation in its operational activities and completing the practical training of the assessors. There will be a reasonable number of laboratories, and certification and inspection bodies to be accredited in Lebanon in order for COLIBAC to generate income for its future activities. Once the organisation is up and running, the next phase will be the linking of COLIBAC into the international system of accreditation bodies, followed by mutual recognition agreements.

Standardisation

The national standards body, LIBNOR, has profited greatly from the technical assistance provided through the Quality Programme and the Sustaining Quality project. They have made a remarkable turn-around and have started their integration into the international standardisation community. They need some further assistance to complete the process, in particular for maintaining, improving and extending their new working procedures and to increase the production of standards. The adoption and implementation of the new law on standardisation would make that a lot easier. Furthermore, they need to integrate with the two remaining international standards organisations, IEC and CENELEC, for which a solution needs to be found together with the Order of Engineers. The prospects for LIBNOR to be a viable organisation in the near future are good.

Market Surveillance

The major challenge for the development of a workable quality infrastructure lays in the development of the market surveillance function. Despite the fact that there are a number of organisations (nominally) involved in market surveillance and despite the fact that technical assistance has been provided for this sector in the past, radical changes are needed. The system as it is now is not able to fulfil its function, and provide a sufficient level of protection to the Lebanese citizens in any meaningful manner. It is low in terms of effectiveness and efficiency. First of all, new and/or revised legislation, as well as implementation decrees for the existing law need to be prepared and passed, to increase the scope of market surveillance, because present regulations are haphazard and mainly incident driven. There is no clear vision of what market surveillance should be responsible for. Secondly, the present organisations need to be themselves convinced of the need for change and show a willingness to engage in such changes. Thirdly, it requires a strong political will to radically change the system and to adopt corresponding legislation and provide the financial means to execute it. Finally, it needs an increase in professionalism, through training, advice and coaching and with the supply of

minimally necessary equipment. There is still a very long way to go before market surveillance in Lebanon will be comparable to any EU country.

Private sector, non-profit sector, and public sector

Organisations within the private sector, the non-profit sector and the public sector are subjects within the functioning of the quality infrastructure and will have to comply with the requirements. That is made easier through the implementation of quality management systems. In some conformity assessment procedures having a certified quality management system is a distinctive advantage, because it automatically leads to the presumption of conformity. The Quality Programme made a great effort in introducing quality management systems in organisations and helped to create a momentum within the business sector. Sustaining that momentum will not be done by providing more of the same, i.e. quality management training and advice. It should be done by challenging organisations to improve their quality on a continuous basis. Therefore, higher levels of quality management system implementation are needed through the introduction of advanced models of business excellence. It also needs a national quality award based on the concept of business excellence. Furthermore, the public sector needs a slightly different approach in which the measurable improvement of the service level takes centre stage.

5 Lessons learned

Basically the Quality Programme was sound in its design, in its objectives and in its resources and could possibly be repeated elsewhere in the same format and with the same success. Nevertheless there are a few issues worth commenting upon and observations to be made, because they could have made the project's implementation more effective and efficient.

A large project as the Quality Programme with a € 15 million budget, an overall input of 8000 days of consultants and effectively a 46 months duration, needs on the one hand a clear set of realistic results to be achieved in order to be accountable and at the other hand enough flexibility to adapt to the changing circumstances. The Inception Report stated a set of ambitious objectives, but at the same time a very detailed set of activities and resource allocations. Moreover, the resource allocations and the time schedules for completion of activities, as well as the time for taking decisions were not always realistically estimated. This has led in the first phases of the project to too much rigidity in project implementation. It would have been better, if such a large project would be setup in a strictly result oriented manner, adhering to the system of project planning and management by objectives. That would have given the project management a certain level of discretion to adapt to changing circumstances and shifting priorities from the beginning.

Some form of coordination between donors of different projects to exchange information about areas of support and planned projects in a timely fashion, would have been helpful. The Quality Programme was at several moments in its existence confronted with other projects crosscutting its domain (e.g. the twinning project on market surveillance, equipment support to laboratories from for example WHO and IAEA, quality marking systems, to mention a few), making it necessary to cope with such events and to adapt results and planning accordingly.

The Quality Programme did have a fixed contracting deadline of 24 August 2006, a fact known from the outset of the project and one on which many activities were focussed and dependent. As events turned out, the summer war of 2006 took place in the period just preceding this deadline and it had serious consequences for the ongoing tenders, which were all entering their final stage of processing. For different reasons, but all due to the war situation, six out of the ten tenders were unsuccessful and consequently 20 percent of the available budget remained unused. The exceptional circumstances would have merited in our view a political decision to postpone the contracting date with at least one month. With hindsight that would have been beneficial for the project (in terms of being able to better achieve its objectives) and for the country.

The tendering process (from preparation to implementation) could all together been handled better. Especially for the equipment tender, some of the problems experienced could have been avoided. There should have been an extra round of consultation with each of the selected laboratories in order to check the equipment specifications on completeness and their descriptions. Experience shows that suppliers tend to give an interpretation to the tender documents strictly to the letter. Desired equipment should be defined in full detail in advance with all the auxiliaries, spare parts, consumables, documents and certificates, because

suppliers do not generally think about equipment in terms of operable systems, but simply in terms of a listing of things to be delivered. Furthermore, such an extra round of consultations would also have been useful for the laboratories to temper their expectations. Laboratories tend to be rather technology oriented when discussing their needs, focussing on the latest state-of-the-art and the top end of the technology scale (and sometimes beyond their present capabilities). Some mitigation of their perceived needs through economic and market considerations can be useful in this respect and should have been part of the consultation process.

Another observation on tendering is the fact that any project with tendering included and a fixed contracting date, should start with the identification of the needs and the preparations of tender dossiers as soon as possible. There seems to be a natural tendency of all parties involved in the tendering process to let the process slip to every possible intermediate deadline and the final result to the very last moment. Projects should manage their tenders in a systematic and expedient way, as far as the process is within their power.

Some problems faced in the execution of certain contracts could have been avoided. As a non-exhaustive example, we could mention the contracts under tender EuropeAid/122119/D/SUP/LB. The duration of contracts was set to three months from the perspective of having about a year to train the laboratory staff and to have a laboratory operational for providing services to third parties within the time horizon of the project. However, this time period proved to be insufficient for a proper execution and led, among other reasons, to delays in the delivery of items, because laboratories were not ready for receiving the supplies and installation as per initial plan.

Another problem facing the project was the unavailability of funds for the execution of final payments. According to the Financing Agreement (Article II.2.2), the money transfers from the EC Delegation "will be made upon a request by the beneficiary supported by a technical and financial report on the relevant activities conducted and after the submission of a satisfactory audit report..." Unfortunately, the auditing took a much longer time than expected. Consequently, the technical and financial report was delayed and, moreover, the approval of these reports required equally a relatively long time. These impediments could have been avoided with an enhanced pre-auditing planning.

The unavailability of funds for the execution of final payments within the contractually established period of time, led to claims from suppliers for late payment interest. Such extra costs could have been avoided.

The budget for the Quality Programme did have a budget line of € 700.000 for contingencies. A contingency is by its nature a financial provision made against future unforeseen events. Such unforeseen events normally surface towards the end of a project. However, contracts for contingencies had to be tendered and contracted before the fixed contracting date, which was close to the mid-term of the programme. That meant that preparation of a possible tender should have started within less than one year from the start of the project. Having to define a contingency item at that time in the project, would certainly mean that the project was not properly considered and/or badly devised. If contingencies are to be treated in this way, it would be a much better option to add this money to the project budget for operational activities in the first place. Now the money for contingencies was largely returned unused to the ECD.

One of the minor problems encountered, was the fact that the selection process and appointments of new staff (either replacement, or additional) in the Quality Unit of the Ministry takes a very long time. As a consequence, positions are not filled immediately, such as for example with the appointment of two administrative assistants and with the replacement of the Enterprise component manager. Such long periods hamper the build up and transfer of know-how within the Quality Unit.

The Quality Programme had to cope with a situation in which there were two major contracts involving technical assistance. There was the contract for the assistance to the Quality Unit, managed by Tecnicas. This contract covered in principle all activities in the Quality Programme and was by its nature very much involved in the management of the programme. The other contract, managed by Gruppo Soges, dealt with substantial support to a limited number of activities within the scope of the Quality Programme. This could have led to a situation in which both projects would develop independently from each other and possibly in diverging ways and with own implementation schedules, leading to conflicts of interest. In order to avoid that situation a decision was made to keep the overall planning concentrated in the Quality Unit with the assistance of Tecnicas. Gruppo Soges would supply the expertise within the framework of the planning provided by the Quality Unit and Tecnicas. From the perspective of the latter two this arrangement worked fine, but from the perspective of Gruppo Soges it was problematic; they would have preferred an own team to manage their contract. With hindsight the only disadvantage experienced from this arrangement, was in the quality of the reporting, as the backstopping staff of Gruppo Soges had no technical expertise to integrate and comprehend the contributions from the experts.